



HAL
open science

Early development, recruitment and life history trajectory in long-lived birds

Emmanuelle Cam, Lise Aubry

► **To cite this version:**

Emmanuelle Cam, Lise Aubry. Early development, recruitment and life history trajectory in long-lived birds. *Journal für Ornithologie = Journal of Ornithology*, 2011, 152 (S1), pp.187-201. 10.1007/s10336-011-0707-0 . hal-00699213

HAL Id: hal-00699213

<https://hal.science/hal-00699213v1>

Submitted on 20 May 2012

HAL is a multi-disciplinary open access archive for the deposit and dissemination of scientific research documents, whether they are published or not. The documents may come from teaching and research institutions in France or abroad, or from public or private research centers.

L'archive ouverte pluridisciplinaire **HAL**, est destinée au dépôt et à la diffusion de documents scientifiques de niveau recherche, publiés ou non, émanant des établissements d'enseignement et de recherche français ou étrangers, des laboratoires publics ou privés.

1 ***Early development, recruitment and life history trajectory in long-***
2 ***lived birds***

3

4

5

6

7 ***Emmanuelle Cam***^{1,2}

8 ¹ UMR CNRS 5175. Biométrie et Biologie des Populations. Centre d'Écologie Fonctionnelle et
9 Évolutive, 1919 route de Mende, 34293 Cedex 05, Montpellier, France.

10 ² UMR CNRS 5174. Laboratoire Évolution et Diversité Biologique, Bâtiment 4R3, 118 route de
11 Narbonne, Université Toulouse III, 31062 Toulouse Cedex 09, France.

12 emmacam@cict.fr, Fax: +33/04 67 41 21 38

13

14 ***Lise Aubry***³

15 ³ Department of Wildland Resources and the Ecology Center, 5230 Old Main Hill, Utah State
16 University, Utah 84322-5230, Logan, U.S.A.

17

18

19

20 **ABSTRACT**

21 Lindström (1999) synthesized knowledge about “early development and fitness in birds
22 and mammals”, interesting tracks and challenges for future studies. Today there is unambiguous
23 evidence that Lindström’s first statement holds in long-lived birds: “It is obvious that adverse
24 environmental conditions might have immediate effects [...]” However, whether there are
25 “long-term fitness consequences of conditions experienced during early development”
26 (Lindström’s second statement) is unclear for long-lived birds. The extent to which the
27 disadvantage of frail individuals at independence is expressed predominantly in terms of higher
28 mortality and disappearance from the population before recruitment, or persists after
29 recruitment, is still an open question. Due to rarity of relevant data and the fact that most studies
30 are retrospective, heterogeneity in methods and time scales hampers identification of general
31 patterns. Nevertheless, several studies have provided evidence of a relationship between early
32 conditions and future reproductive parameters, or lifetime reproductive success. Evidence from
33 large mammals suggests substantial long-term individual and population effects of early
34 conditions, including trans-generational maternal effects. Evidence from short-lived birds also
35 suggests long-term individual consequences, and maternal effects have been documented in long-
36 lived ones. Despite logistical and financial difficulties inherent in long-term studies, they are the
37 only way of addressing Lindström’s second statement. Existing long-term longitudinal data sets
38 should be re-analyzed using recently developed capture-mark-recapture models handling state
39 uncertainty and unobservable heterogeneity in populations. Statistical methods designed to
40 estimate lifetime reproductive success or incorporate pedigree information in standard situations
41 of studies of wild vertebrates with imperfect detection offer new opportunities to assess long-
42 term fitness consequences of early development in long-lived birds.

43 **Keywords:** life history evolution, longitudinal studies, long-term effects, population
44 dynamics

45 **INTRODUCTION**

46 **Background.** A decade ago, in a paper entitled “Early development and fitness in birds
47 and mammals”, Lindström (1999) stated that “It is obvious that adverse environmental
48 conditions might have immediate effects [...]. However, the long-term fitness consequences of
49 conditions experienced during early development have been documented only recently”. Long-
50 lasting effects of early conditions are receiving growing attention because large differences in
51 lifetime reproductive success among individuals may result from differences in the conditions
52 under which growth or ontogeny from birth to recruitment take place (de Kogel 1997; Hamel et
53 al. 2009; Metcalf and Monaghan 2001; Newton 1989; van de Pol et al. 2006 a). In addition, it has
54 been shown that life history characteristics such as senescence rate may vary with conditions
55 during development (Nussey et al. 2007). Individuals may compensate adverse early conditions
56 by growing fast when conditions improve, but may incur delayed costs and reduced longevity
57 (Metcalf and Monaghan 2001, 2003). Here the main question we will focus on is whether there
58 is evidence of long-term *fitness* consequences of early conditions in long-lived birds (evidence of
59 morphological or physiological consequences isn’t ‘sufficient’). It is not our intention to provide a
60 full review of the literature on the topic. We recognize that our perception of current knowledge
61 on the subject in the literature led us to express a subjective opinion inspired by a large number
62 of studies addressing small parts of the problem in a large range of species; of course, the same
63 body of material may inspire different opinions in other researchers.

64 **A flurry of traits, mechanisms and consequences.** As summarized in Burness
65 et al. (2000), in mammals and birds, the environment experienced during ontogeny may have
66 morphological, behavioral and life history consequences. Individuals experiencing harsh
67 conditions during development (e.g., parasite load, weather, food availability) may exhibit smaller
68 structural size and mass at independence, lower survival probability in the first year, and lower
69 recruitment probability (Boag 1987; Braasch et al. 2009; de Kogel 1997; Dijkstra et al. 1990; Hall

70 et al. 2001; Magrath 1991; McDonald et al. 2005; Naef-Daenzer et al. 2001; Perrins 1965; Richner
71 1989; Sedinger et al. 1995; Szép and Møller 1999; Tinbergen and Boerlijst 1990; van der Jeugd
72 and Larsson 1998; Verboven and Visser 1998). There is some indication that fledging date,
73 structural size or mass at independence influence the probability of acquiring a territory as well
74 (Both et al. 1999; Drent 1983). If they reach reproductive status, individuals may exhibit lower
75 reproductive fitness components (e.g., smaller egg or clutch sizes; Braasch et al. 2009; Gorman
76 and Nager 2004; Haywood and Perrins 1992; Potti 1999; Schluter and Gustafsson 1993).
77 Differences in reproductive success may sometimes result from use of lower-quality breeding
78 habitat (see Verhulst et al. 1997 for an example in a long-lived bird, the Oystercatcher
79 (*Haematopus ostralegus*) or access to lower-quality mates because of lack of attractiveness of
80 secondary sexual characters (Blount et al. 2003; de Kogel and Prijs 1996; de Kogel 1997; but see
81 Walling et al. 2007 in a different taxon). Variation in the quality of the rearing environment is
82 assumed to result in differences in the physiological condition (Burness et al. 2000) or
83 morphology of individuals reared in that environment, which in turn may result in differences in
84 survival probabilities, and possibly variation in the adult physiological or morphological
85 phenotype (de Kogel and Prijs 1996; Haywood and Perrins 1992; Perrins 1965; Schluter and
86 Gustafsson 1993; but see Lendwai et al. 2009). Differences in personalities (and correlated fitness
87 differences) may also arise from early environment (Dingemanse et al. 2004; Dingemanse and
88 Réale 2005; Krause et al. 2009; Stamps and Groothuis 2010). Alternatively, there may not be any
89 observable trait associated with lower survival (or at least one we know how to identify and
90 measure), which may result in a “cryptic” structure of populations (Fox and Kendall 2002;
91 Kendall and Fox 2002). Last, evidence has been found in long-lived species that offspring early
92 survival depends on sex under stressful conditions (e.g., Nager et al. 2000).

93 ***Increased interest in physiological ‘paths’.*** There is currently increased interest
94 in physiological mechanisms (‘paths’) responsible for the long-term consequences of early

95 development (e.g., Merilä and Svensson 1997; Thomas et al. 2007). There is evidence that early
96 life development can directly affect the immune system and physiology through trans-
97 generational effects, both positively and negatively. Müller et al. (2009) have shown that maternal
98 hormones in bird eggs enhanced post-natal growth rate on the one hand, but decreased
99 asymptotic mass and reduced survival probability on the other hand. Groothuis et al. (2005) have
100 experimentally shown that yolk androgens suppress immune function but simultaneously
101 stimulate growth in Black-headed Gull chicks (*Larus ridibundus*). Thus, “mothers face a trade-off
102 between these costs and benefits and may tune hormone deposition to prevailing conditions that
103 influence chick survival”. Maternal yolk androgens have also been shown to affect a number of
104 adult or juvenile traits including social dominance, neophobia, dispersal, male sexual characters,
105 and male attractiveness (e.g., Eising et al. 2006; Gil 2003; Rubolini et al. 2006; Tobler and Sandell
106 2007; Tschirren et al. 2007). Stress, through elevated glucocorticosteroids during early life can
107 also impair physiological development. In a wild population of White Storks (*Ciconia ciconia*),
108 developing juveniles that released more corticosterone in response to a common stressor
109 experienced lower survival and recruitment a few years later in life (Blas et al. 2007). In the same
110 vein, pathogen exposure during the development of immunocompetence can affect an
111 individual’s ability to fight off pathogens later in life (Franceschi et al. 2000), which may influence
112 reproductive performance and survival chances throughout life (Finch and Crimmins 2004).
113 Boulinier and Staszewski (2008) reviewed evidence of transfer of antibodies from mother to
114 offspring, and Gasparini et al. (2007) found evidence of variation in such transfers according to
115 food availability in a wild long-lived bird species, the Kittiwake (*Rissa tridactyla*).

116 Caloric restriction during the earliest stages of life (i.e., foetal development in utero) can
117 impair development, and is thought to increase risks of disease later in life. In humans, reduced
118 fetal growth is strongly associated with a number of chronic conditions later in life including
119 coronary heart disease, stroke, diabetes, and hypertension (‘the Barker hypothesis’; Barker 1994).
120 Some human cohort studies support the Barker hypothesis (e.g., Doblhammer and Vaupel 2001)

121 while others have found greater support for an effect of exposure to infectious diseases in the
122 first year of life on the ability to fight pathogens later in life (i.e., the ‘inflammatory exposure
123 hypothesis’; Bengtsson and Lindström 2000; Finch and Crimmins 2004). Because of the intricate
124 connection between endocrine and immune systems in animals, these two hypotheses may be
125 difficult to disentangle (Franceschi et al. 2000), but nevertheless are likely to have similar
126 demographic consequences.

127 ***‘Population’ and ‘individual’ consequences.*** Long-term individual consequences
128 of conditions during development have been extensively addressed in short-lived birds as early as
129 four decades ago (Haywood and Perrins 1992; Gustafsson and Sutherland 1988; Perrins 1965;
130 van Noordwijk et al. 1988). Similarly, a number of long-term longitudinal studies of large
131 mammals have addressed the relationship between early life development and population
132 dynamics (Albon et al. 1987; Forchhammer et al. 2001; Saether 1997), as well as the individual
133 fitness consequences of early life environmental conditions (Kruuk et al. 1999; Festa-Bianchet et
134 al. 2000; Gaillard et al. 2000; Nussey et al. 2007; Rose et al. 1999). Population phenomena
135 resulting from early conditions shared by individuals in a cohort are considered ‘indirect effects’
136 and suspected to be common (Benton et al. 2006). For example, Benton et al. (2006)
137 hypothesized that stages (e.g., age classes) “which are reduced in density may lead to
138 compensatory increases in the density of other stages (Cameron and Benton 2004; Moe et al.
139 2002).” Population consequences of early conditions have probably received more attention in
140 large mammals than long-lived birds (Albon et al. 1987; Seather 1997; but see Votier et al. 2008).
141 Such consequences may result from delayed effects of increased mortality at early stages of life in
142 some cohorts (individuals born in the same year), which leads to smaller (future) population size
143 for example. Early conditions can also translate into lower future reproductive performance and
144 population productivity of young raised under poor conditions. In other words, population
145 consequences of early conditions sometimes imply long-term consequences of these conditions

146 at the individual level, but they may result solely from early disappearance of frail individuals
147 from the population before breeding (phenotypic mortality selection). Individuals from a given
148 cohort affected by adverse early conditions may die early, when survivors (that recruit and breed)
149 do not necessarily differ from other individuals in the breeding segment of the population.
150 Alternatively, early conditions may have long-lasting effects on individuals without necessarily
151 affecting survival; such frail individuals may recruit but exhibit poorer reproductive performance
152 for example. Of course, the two scenarios may hold simultaneously (Rose et al. 1999).

153 ***LONG-LIVED SPECIES***

154 Despite increased interest in this topic because of identification of possible causes of
155 population dynamics and life history phenomena (Lindström 1999), knowledge and
156 understanding of long-term consequences of early conditions is undoubtedly unbalanced in
157 short- *versus* long-lived birds (Meathrel and Carey 2007). There is no clear definition of short- or
158 long-lived species; here long-lived species will be (loosely) referred to as species where a
159 substantial proportion of individuals defer breeding (beyond age one) and where mean
160 reproductive longevity (i.e., after recruitment) may reach 4 years or more (based on estimates
161 available in the literature). In long-lived bird species, the extent to which the disadvantage of
162 individuals that are ‘frail’ at independence is expressed predominantly in terms of higher mortality
163 before recruitment (Braasch et al. 2009; Nevoux et al. 2010), or persists after recruitment (Reid et
164 al. 2003) is still unclear. Here ‘frailty’ may concern many different phenotypic traits: structural
165 size, body condition, physiological state, morphology, personality, etc.

166 Depending on the fitness component considered, studies of long-term fitness
167 consequences of early conditions in different species have provided some indication that fitness
168 consequences are either not perceptible before recruitment (post-fledging survival and
169 recruitment probability; Hipfner 1999; Drummond et al. 2003), not detectable after recruitment,

170 or no longer detectable after recruitment even if earlier fitness consequences might have been
171 detected (Nevoux et al. 2010). Alternatively, Van de Pol et al. (2006 a) found evidence of long-
172 term consequences of the quality of the habitat experienced during growth in Oystercatchers on
173 both survival probability and reproductive success, through the quality of the habitat they recruit
174 in. Similarly, Cam et al. (2003) found evidence of long-term consequences of the length of the
175 rearing period on reproductive success after recruitment in Kittiwakes. Reid et al. (2003; 2008)
176 also found evidence of a relationship between early cohort conditions and future breeding
177 success in Choughs (*Pyrrhonorax pyrrhonorax*), or between natal location and adult survival. In other
178 words, there is substantial heterogeneity in results according to the species, study design and
179 methods used to collect or analyze data. Nevertheless, studies of long-lived birds share some
180 common challenges and features (see below).

181 ***Specific methodological challenges.*** Most studies of the consequences of early
182 conditions in long-lived birds have addressed relatively short-term fitness consequences on
183 fitness compared to the time scale at which reproduction takes place (e.g., survival from hatching
184 to fledging or survival just after fledging; Viñuela 1999). Due to extended pre-breeding period
185 (sometimes longer than 10 years in seabirds; e.g., Jenouvrier et al. 2008) and ‘insufficient’
186 duration of research projects (relative to the mean longevity in the studied species), most studies
187 have focused on the following traits: post-fledging juvenile survival, survival from independence
188 to recruitment, or recruitment probability (Hario and Rintala 2009; Meathrel and Carey 2007).
189 Longer term consequences of conditions during development have rarely been addressed
190 (Nevoux et al. 2010). Naturally, a large number of studies of short-lived birds also have focused
191 on pre-breeding survival and age of first breeding (e.g., Lindén et al. 1992; Magrath 1991;
192 Verboven and Visser 1998).

193 Ironically, despite the specific interest of studies of stages immediately following
194 dependence on parents (and the possible short-term influence of the quality of rearing

195 environment and parental care on fitness components), survival after independence is one of the
196 most difficult demographic parameters to estimate in long-lived birds (especially seabirds, but not
197 exclusively). Indeed, many long-term studies assume or observe that yearlings (or sometimes
198 older) usually do not return to colonies or breeding locations that year (e.g., Croxall et al. 1990;
199 Jenouvrier et al. 2008), they sometimes ignore resightings of pre-breeders because they are too
200 few (e.g., Nevoux et al. 2010), and recapture probability at age 1 is set to 0 in capture-mark-
201 recapture models (e.g., Votier et al. 2008). In addition, a common limitation is the confounding
202 of mortality and permanent emigration out of the study area; the latter is particularly difficult to
203 assess in species with large distribution areas (e.g., Koenig et al. 1996; Link et al. 2002) unless
204 (still) expensive electronic devices are used (provided such devices can be used, depending on
205 size and battery life expectancy). This is particularly problematic in situations where dispersal
206 probability varies with individual features determined during development, e.g., body mass and
207 condition in juveniles (Barbraud et al. 2003; Belthoff and Duffy 1998). Schreiber et al. (2004) and
208 Hénaux et al. (2007) provided evidence of a relationship between early conditions at the colony
209 scale and natal dispersal probability in a long-lived bird.

210 **Cohort effects as ‘proxies’ of early conditions.** Cohort studies can be helpful
211 when individual traits at fledging (i.e., traits assumed to reflect conditions during development;
212 e.g., body condition, structural size, etc.) are not measured. There is a long tradition of such
213 studies in long-lived birds and large mammals (e.g., Albon et al. 1987; Cam et al. 2005;
214 Christensen 1999; Nevoux et al. 2010; Reid et al. 2003). The long-term fitness consequences of
215 early conditions can be addressed by investigating whether individuals born in different years
216 exhibit similar fitness components at later age (age-specific survival, recruitment probability,
217 success probability after recruitment). ‘Early conditions’ are then defined as conditions
218 experienced by groups of newborns (weather, food availability, population, density, or simply
219 ‘year’, etc.; Crespin et al. 2006). Benton et al. (2006) emphasized that “The way that traits covary

220 means that individuals that experience common environmental conditions can carry the signature
 221 of those conditions throughout life. This is especially true of exposure to early environments,
 222 which can lead to marked differences in the life histories of cohorts of organisms born at
 223 different times (Bateson et al. 2004; Beckerman et al. 2002; Lindström 1999; Loison et al. 2004;
 224 Reid et al. 2003; Solberg et al. 2004).” To determine whether cohort effects reflect the influence
 225 of conditions in the year of birth on a later fitness component (e.g., recruitment probability), or a
 226 relationship between the fitness component addressed and the conditions in the year it is
 227 assessed (e.g., food availability in the year of recruitment; Spear et al. 1993), accounting for year
 228 effects is necessary. However, cohort, age, and year effects cannot be completely separated.

229 **Extreme heterogeneity in traits affected by early development and**
 230 **fitness components.** Many hypotheses have been put forward concerning traits that may be
 231 affected by early conditions, most of which relate to pathogens and energetic stress associated
 232 with breeding phenology and food abundance, the efficiency of parental care, or the number of
 233 siblings competing for parental care. However, we won’t venture to describe any ‘general
 234 relationship’ between early conditions and traits in long lived birds, or any ‘universal’ pool of
 235 traits influenced by early development. Ludwigs and Becker (2006) reviewed 22 studies of post-
 236 fledging survival in long-lived seabirds and found that 10 pre-fledging traits potentially covary
 237 with survival (“clutch size, hatching order, hatching date, fledglings per brood, growth rate, body
 238 size, chick peak mass, fledging mass, body condition, fledging age”). Additional papers (including
 239 on geese) confirm the profusion of traits, fitness components, and relationships between such
 240 traits and fitness. A relationship between fledging date and fledging survival in Guillemots (*Uria*
 241 *aalge*; Harris et al. 2008) and Sooty Terns (*Onychoprion fuscatus*, formerly *Sterna Fuscata*, Fear 2002),
 242 but not body condition (Harris et al. 2008). A relationship between fledging size (wing length),
 243 and marginally mass, survival up to recruitment, and age of first return in Tufted Puffins
 244 (*Fratecula cirrhata*; Morrison et al. (2009). A relationship between body mass, structural size at

245 fledging (tarsus length) and pre-breeding survival in Barnacle Geese (*Branta leucopsis*; van der
246 Jeugd and Larsson 1998), but not date of birth. A relationship between body mass at fledging and
247 recruitment probability in Common Terns (*Sterna hirundo*; Ludwigs and Becker 2006), but not
248 clutch size, hatching order, number of fledglings per brood, or recruitment of fledged young. In
249 Western Gulls (*Larus occidentalis*), neither hatching order, hatching date, brood size had
250 consequences on age-specific survival from independence to recruitment, nor recruitment
251 probability (Spear et al. 1993). Similar results were found concerning body mass in Black Brant
252 (*Branta bernicla*, Sedinger et al. 2004). In contrast, Cam et al. (2003) concluded that there was a
253 relationship between the length of the rearing period in Kittiwakes, pre-breeding survival and
254 recruitment probability. In the Short-tailed Shearwaters (*Puffinus tenuirostris*), Meathrel and Carey
255 (2007) concluded that none of the intrinsic factors (parental quality, the size and weight of the
256 egg) “seemed to explain why some chicks returned to prospect and breed, while others did not.
257 [...] analyses were unable to detect which intrinsic factors could be important to recruitment in
258 this species.” They suggested that “factors operating outside the breeding season and away from
259 the Bass Strait islands may determine whether or not a chick survives to return to breed”.

260 ***Heterogeneity across life histories.*** Ludwigs and Becker (2006), and Meathrel
261 and Carey (2007) hypothesized that specific differences in life histories explain why some
262 phenotypic traits before fledging influence post-fledging survival or recruitment probability in
263 some seabird species, but not in others. In some species, fledglings experience the transition from
264 breeding site to the open sea alone, when parents still provide care in some others. Meathrel and
265 Carey (2007) emphasized that in tube-nosed seabirds “all species for which a relationship
266 between fledging weight and post-fledging survival or recruitment has been documented, become
267 independent of their parents just before fledging, such as the Short-tailed Shearwaters who desert
268 their young up to a month before fledging (Serventy 1967), so whether or not they return as
269 adults is independent of direct parental investment after fledging”. Along this line, Ludwigs and

270 Becker (2006) highlighted that “Terns benefit from prolonged parental guidance after fledging
271 (Burger, 1980; pers. obs.). In this respect, they could be described as intermediate between auks,
272 which leave the colony under parental care at a pre-fledging stage (Harris et al., 1992; Hedgren,
273 1981; Lloyd, 1979), and Shearwaters, which are all but independent at fledging (Mougin et al.
274 2000; Perrins et al. 1973; Sagar and Horning 1998). Chicks of Common Murres (Harris et al.
275 1992; Hedgren 1981)) and Razorbills (*Alca torda*) (Lloyd, 1979) leave the colony long before
276 independence, and are fed by their parents for a long period at sea before reaching their
277 ‘independence’ mass. That may well be one reason why, in the Alcidae, no evidence has been
278 found for any influence by pre-fledging body mass on survival after fledging” (but see Harris et
279 al. 2008). Similarly, Stienen and Brenninkmeier (2002) hypothesized that parental provisioning
280 after fledging buffers juvenile against growth disadvantages that they experienced prior to leaving
281 their colony (see also Fear 2002). Parents can buffer environmental variation to some extent (e.g.
282 increase foraging effort when resource availability decreases; Erikstad et al. 1998). As emphasized
283 by Ludwigs and Becker (2006) and Meathrel and Carey (2007), relevant measurable traits are
284 likely to be species-specific, or at least specific to classes of species sharing common ecological
285 and lifestyle characteristics.

286 ***Methodological heterogeneity.*** The difficulty in identifying ‘general patterns’ in the
287 literature partly reflects methodological differences across studies in data collection and analysis.
288 For example, in a study of Barnacle Geese, van der Jeugd and Larsson (1998) hypothesized that
289 they did not find evidence of hatching date on post-fledging survival because of the time of
290 capture: hatching dates in the sample of young birds that survived to the age of capture wasn’t
291 representative of the whole population. Indeed, many other studies have documented a
292 relationship between hatching date and post-fledging survival (e.g., Harris et al. 1994; 2008;
293 Korpimäki and Lagerström 1988). Concerning data analysis, analytical methods to estimate age-
294 and state-specific survival probability (e.g., pre-breeders versus breeders), recruitment probability,

295 and breeding probability after recruitment, have drastically changed over the past three decades:
296 current methods allow investigators to account for imperfect detection of individuals *in natura*
297 (Williams et al. 2002), or to base their study on a local detection rate close to one (new techniques
298 of remote and electronic recording of individuals, e.g. Dittmann et al. 2003, Becker et al. 2008,
299 Braasch et al. 2009, Limmer and Becker 2010). Some studies of fitness consequences of early
300 conditions have used such approaches, have estimated detection probability and provided
301 estimates of fitness components not confounded with detection rate (e.g., Cooch 2002; Nevoux
302 et al. 2010; Reed et al. 2003; Votier et al. 2008; van der Jeugd and Larsson 1998; Votier et al.
303 2008;), whereas some others haven't (mostly relatively old studies that could not yet benefit from
304 those approaches; e.g., Croxall et al. 1990; Spear and Nur 1994), making comparisons among
305 studies difficult.

306 Due to relative rarity of relevant data sets to address long-term consequences of early
307 conditions in long-lived bird species and to the fact that many studies are retrospective (i.e., *a*
308 *posteriori* use of data not necessarily collected for that purpose), heterogeneity in methods used
309 and time scales considered hampers identification of general patterns. The first statement in
310 Lindström (1999) clearly holds: "It is obvious that adverse environmental conditions might have
311 immediate effects [...]." Evidence has been found of effects lasting up to recruitment in species
312 delaying recruitment for several years. However, whether there are "long-term fitness
313 consequences of conditions experienced during early development" (Lindström's second
314 statement) is still an open question in the vast majority of long-lived bird species. In a review
315 focusing on humans, Ulijaszek (1996) defined 'early conditions' as follows: "what constitutes an
316 early environmental influence is anything that happens before full developmental maturity is
317 achieved". Humans have extended childhood and in most societies extended parental care, a
318 feature suggested as creating substantial differences between mammals and birds in long-term

319 consequences of conditions during development (see Reinhold 2002 concerning maternal effects
320 for example). However, at least some recent results from wild long-lived bird species have
321 provided evidence that conditions during the rearing period (e.g., length of the rearing period,
322 habitat quality), and possibly the efficiency of parental care, both have long-term consequences
323 on fitness components (e.g., Cam et al. 2003; Van de Pol et al. 2006 a). Importantly, assessment
324 of lifetime consequences of early conditions in long-lived birds is still extremely rare (e.g., Reid et
325 al. 2003). In a study of lifetime reproductive success in Oystercatchers, Van de Pol et al. (2006 a)
326 provided evidence that “long-term effects of early conditions contributed more to overall fitness
327 differences than short-term consequences, contrary to common conceptions on this issue. Short-
328 term effects of early conditions lead to the large underestimation of fitness consequences”.

329 ***WHERE TO NEXT?***

330 ***New analytical methods.*** Future studies should gain insight into whether early
331 conditions have long-lasting effects on fitness in long-lived birds by re-analyzing available long-
332 term data sets using homogeneous analytical approaches. In the 1990's, statisticians started
333 developing methods to estimate ‘state-specific’ fitness components (survival probability,
334 recruitment probability, breeding probability and success after recruitment) from individually
335 marked individuals in situations where not all individuals alive and present in the study area were
336 observed (multistate capture-recapture models; Arnason 1973; Hestbeck et al. 1991; Nichols and
337 Kendall 1995; Schwarz et al. 1993). Such models are required to estimate survival probability in
338 pre-breeders and breeders of the same age for example, i.e., individuals in different reproductive
339 ‘states’, where individuals change state in a stochastic manner. In species with delayed maturity,
340 failure to observe, contact or capture individuals for several years raises substantial difficulties in
341 studies of consequences of early conditions on fitness. To handle such situations, several authors
342 treated the pre-breeding stage as an unobservable state (e.g., Crespin et al. 2006; Jenouvrier et al.
343 2008; Nevoux et al. 2010). Simultaneously, statisticians started developing approaches to handle

344 uncertainty in state assignment (Kendall 2004). Such approaches are relevant when observers
345 cannot assess with certainty whether individuals breed, or not, a common situation in bird studies
346 where individuals breed unsuccessfully and no longer attend breeding sites for example; they may
347 be considered as non-breeders (possibly pre-breeders), or floaters.

348 A recent extension of multistate models developed by Pradel (2005; see also Choquet et
349 al. 2009), ‘Multievent models’ are especially designed to handle state uncertainty. Importantly,
350 Rouan et al. (2009) developed a method (derived from Multievent models) to estimate lifetime
351 reproductive success when breeding status cannot always be assessed. Other approaches to
352 construct sequences of discrete states using hidden Markov chains have been applied in
353 molecular ecology or weather forecasting for example (Cappé et al. 2005) and can be used in the
354 capture-mark-recapture setting (see Dupuis 1995 for one of the first applications not extended
355 yet to inferences about lifetime reproductive success). This development should prove
356 particularly useful to re-investigate long-term consequences of early conditions in long-lived birds
357 using available data sets. Indeed, the method handles a major feature of capture-mark-recapture
358 studies of wild vertebrates (imperfect detection), and doesn’t require that all individuals are
359 monitored over their entire life (i.e., right censored data can be used).

360 Another recent development of capture-mark-recapture models may prove useful to
361 assess long-term fitness consequences of early conditions. A difficulty inherent in longitudinal
362 studies of fitness components is disentangling within-cohort phenotypic mortality selection and
363 genuine variation of these components throughout life (Vaupel and Yashin 1985). To address this
364 question, accounting for unobserved heterogeneity in populations (Jones et al. 2010) is common
365 in human demography (see Vaupel et al. 1979 for one of the first papers on the topic). Recently,
366 Gimenez and Choquet (2010), Marzolin et al. (2011), and Royle (2008) have combined capture-
367 mark-recapture models with models accounting for such heterogeneity and re-analyzed a
368 ‘famous’ data set collected by Marzolin (2002; European Dipper *Cinclus cinclus*; cited in virtually

369 any textbook on capture-mark-recapture modeling). This approach will help investigators re-
370 analyze existing long-term data sets (including ones continuing at present) and assess whether the
371 consequences of early conditions persist throughout life, or if early conditions mostly affect
372 survival in younger age classes, with frail individuals progressively disappearing from populations
373 via within-cohort phenotypic mortality selection. In addition, this approach can be used to
374 address whether models incorporating measurable covariates (describing early conditions)
375 perform better than models also accounting for unobserved heterogeneity, and thus assess the
376 contribution of early conditions to differences in fitness components among individuals (Aubry
377 et al. 2011; Cam et al. 2002 a; Jones et al. 2010). Although very data hungry, statistical models
378 accounting for the stochastic change in individuals 'state' and individual covariates may allow
379 disentangling long-term effects of early conditions and short-term carry over effects (Harrison et
380 al. 2011).

381 ***Individual 'quality'***. The concept of 'quality' (of parents, eggs, offspring) is pervasive
382 in studies of conditions during growth and their consequences on offspring fitness (e.g., Bize et
383 al. 2002; Vergara et al. 2010). In birds, early conditions start at the egg stage. Meathrel et al.
384 (1993), and Meathrel and Carey (2007) illustrated the importance of the 'quality' hypothesis in
385 studies of consequences of conditions during development: "egg size in seabirds is commonly
386 held to be an important index of egg quality because it is thought to reflect the quantity of
387 nutrient reserves available to the chick during embryonic development and at hatching (Boersma
388 1982)." "High rates of survival for chicks hatching from large eggs may be a consequence of egg
389 size per se, or of the ability of high quality parents to lay eggs and to subsequently provide
390 superior care to nestlings (Meathrel et al. 1993). Both egg size and offspring survival are likely to
391 be affected by parental attributes, in particular those of the maternal parent (Nager et al. 2006)."
392 Maternal expenditure (egg size) is logically assumed to be related to traits (morphological,
393 physiological) of the young at birth (hatching), but there is unambiguous evidence that offspring

394 traits at independence also depend on parental care in long-lived birds, which may have long-
395 lasting effects on offspring fitness. For example, in an experimental study of Oystercatchers, Van
396 de Pol et al. (2006 b) found evidence that there was a relationship between rearing conditions
397 (environmental or parental quality), but not egg size, and offspring survival over 50 days.

398 Despite the difficulty inherent in definition and measurement of ‘individual quality’
399 (Bergeron et al. 2010; Lailvaux and Kasumovic 2011; Wilson and Nussey 2009), the hypothesis
400 that parents differ in ‘quality’ plays such a large part in studies of conditions during growth and
401 their consequences on offspring (e.g., Bize et al. 2002; Vergara et al. 2010; Wendeln and Becker
402 1999) that investigators should attempt to be specific about the way they use this concept. It may
403 not always be possible to ‘measure’ quality: in studies of primates, Hawkes (2010) and Jones *et al*
404 (2010) recently re-emphasized that investigators may not always be able to define measurable
405 criteria *a priori* to rank individuals according to the quality of care they may provide to offspring,
406 and then model-based inference should be used to account for heterogeneity in fitness among
407 parents. In addition, ‘quality’ rarely comes down to morphology and physiology (but see e.g.,
408 Wendeln and Becker 1999). When the conditions are met, behavioral traits that may partly reflect
409 parental experience and the pair common experience (e.g., coordination) should be considered.
410 In Common Guillemots, Lewis et al. (2006) used detailed behavioral data from parents to
411 characterize pair quality based on time spent together at the site and chick feeding rates. They
412 also used trip duration at the individual level to assess the quality of care provided by the
413 individual parent. They concluded that the pair effect on breeding success was larger than the one
414 of each parent alone. Using a longitudinal approach, Limmer and Becker (2009) found that chick
415 provisioning improves with parental experience in Common Terns. In Kestrels (*Falco tinnunculus*),
416 Vergara et al. (2010) used the duration of the post-fledging dependence period to assess parental
417 quality.

418 **Timing of trait measurement.** When fledglings' traits are measured, studies should
 419 consider carefully the questions of the time scale considered, timing of measurement of traits,
 420 and consistency (or correlation through life) in individual traits over time (e.g., Carere et al. 2005;
 421 van Oers et al. 2004 a). Festa-Bianchet et al. (2000) addressed this issue thoroughly in a study of
 422 Bighorn Sheep (*Ovis canadensis*). They did not find evidence of a relationship between mass in 3-
 423 week old lambs and adult mass or lifetime reproductive success in ewes. However, "mass gain
 424 during lactation, possibly but not necessarily related to the amount of maternal care received,
 425 affects adult mass and reproductive success. Mass gain over several years and the number of ewes
 426 in the population strongly affects adult mass in both sexes and therefore can have profound
 427 effects on reproductive success in this long lived species with a multi-year growth period".
 428 Detailed behavioral observations are necessary to address post fledging parental care in birds and
 429 its role in transition to independence (Ashmole and Humberto 1968; Heinsohn 1991). In the
 430 Short-tailed Shearwater, Meathrel and Carey (2007) concluded that "there were only weak
 431 relationships between parental quality, the size and weight of the egg and the chick at 2 months
 432 of age". Similarly, in Common Terns, Braasch et al. (2009) found that "neither the date of
 433 hatching nor the departure age was found to affect survival. The only predictor of survival was
 434 last post-fledging body mass whereas fledging mass itself was of minor importance." In Lesser
 435 Snow Geese (a nidifugous species, *Anser caerulescens caerulescens*), there was a correlation between
 436 gosling size and adult size (Cooch et al. 1991). Sedinger et al. (1995) found similar results in Black
 437 Brant, as well as Larsson and Forslund (1987) in Barnacle Geese (*Branta leucopsis*). Geese select
 438 mates assortatively (Choudbury et al. 1992), so size is likely to influence the probability of finding
 439 a mate and breeding.

440 **Ontogeny.** As highlighted earlier, Ulijaszek (1996) defined 'early conditions' as follows:
 441 "what constitutes an early environmental influence is [...] anything that happens before full
 442 developmental maturity is achieved". This definition of 'early conditions' in humans includes

443 ontogeny and development during adolescence. Ontogeny may concern the entire life but here
444 we focus on conditions before recruitment in birds. In a study of Eurasian Dippers (*Cinclus*
445 *cinclus*) Yoerg (1997) addressed the relationship between acquisition of adult foraging skills and
446 age at independence and concluded that transition to independence did not require full maturity.
447 This highlights the importance of learning after independence (e.g., Watson and Hatch 1999) for
448 survival and future recruitment. A common difficulty in studies of long-term consequences of
449 early conditions is that development in long-lived species encompasses several years, and
450 conditions during development also include adolescence and behavioral development before
451 sexual maturity and recruitment. This raises the question of ontogeny and learning, a biological
452 feature acknowledged as potentially important for life history evolution in vertebrates for
453 example (Charlesworth 1994). In species with delayed breeding, environmental conditions
454 experienced during the pre-breeding stage (e.g., weather conditions at sea for seabirds) may
455 override the influence of conditions during early development before independence. Individual
456 behavior during this stage may have strong consequences on fitness (survival and recruitment
457 probability for example), and may also override the influence of early conditions.

458 As emphasized by Jenouvrier et al. (2008), “recruitment to a breeding population is a
459 gradual, complex process for long-lived species with delayed maturity”. It has long been known
460 that in many bird species immatures return to colonies several years before breeding (e.g., Cadiou
461 et al. 1994; Cadiou 1999; Chabryk and Coulon 1976; Danchin et al. 1991; Dittmann and Becker
462 2003; Dittmann et al. 2005; 2007; Halley et al. 1995; Klomp and Furness 1992; Nelson 1987;
463 Pickering 1989). The behavior, arrival dates, and activities of young birds before recruitment (i.e.,
464 in pre-breeders) may have a substantial influence on age of first breeding, and the quality of the
465 recruitment habitat (Bruinzeel and Van de Pol 2002). For example, familiarity with sites and
466 potential neighbors may facilitate accession to breeding status and successful reproduction by
467 reducing aggression (Cadiou et al. 1994; Cadiou 1999; Dittmann and Becker 2003; Dittmann et al.

468 2005; 2007; Halley et al. 1995;). In the Kittiwake Cam et al. (2002 b) addressed age-specific
469 survival, recruitment probability, and reproductive success over life as a function of behavior
470 during the pre-breeding period (activities assumed to play a part in territory acquisition and
471 integration into the local social web), and found evidence of a relationship between both
472 covariates and fitness components up to recruitment. There is indication that pre-breeders
473 attending breeding locations, involved in nest building activities or coordination activities with a
474 mate have a higher probability of recruiting than others, and of breeding successfully in the first
475 breeding attempt (Cam et al. 2002 b). There may not be any detectable direct relationship
476 between pre-breeding behavior and breeding success other than in the first attempt, but there is
477 one between age of recruitment and subsequent breeding success (i.e., some indirect
478 consequences of behavior during the pre-breeding period; Aubry et al. 2009 a b; Cam et al. 2002
479 b; Limmer and Becker 2010). Investigating ontogeny requires detailed behavioral studies; such
480 data are likely to be missing in retrospective analysis of existing long-term studies. However,
481 depending on the importance of the part played by conditions (including social conditions,
482 competition, etc.) and pre-breeding activities in the recruitment process, behavioral observations
483 during the pre-breeding stage may substantially help explain future reproductive trajectory (e.g.,
484 van de Pol et al. 2007). This should help address whether conditions between independence and
485 recruitment override the influence of early conditions on fitness after recruitment. In addition,
486 improvement of remote tracking techniques based on electronic devices may contribute to
487 investigate pre-breeders' activities such as prospecting, involvement in social activities before
488 breeding, and conditions experienced at that stage (Becker et al. 2008; Bogdanova et al. 2011;
489 Dittman and Becker 2003).

490 ***Heritability and parental effects.*** A question currently receiving growing attention
491 is the extent to which morphological (e.g., structural size), physiological (e.g., body condition) and
492 personality traits are determined genetically and are heritable (e.g., Authier et al. 2011;

493 Dingemanse et al. 2004; Dingemanse and Réale 2005; Drent et al. 2003; Garnett 1981; Kontainen
494 et al. 2008; Larsson and Forslund 1992; Larsson 1993; Merilä et al. 2001; Réale and Festa-
495 Bianchet 2003; Schluter and Gustafsson 1993; Stamps and Groothuis 2010; Téplitsky et al. 2008;
496 van Noordwijk et al. 1988; van Oers et al. 2005). Similarly, fitness components themselves may
497 be heritable (e.g., Charmantier 2006 a b; Kontiainen et al. 2007). In addition, Lindström (1999)
498 identified maternal and paternal effects as “important sources of individual variation in early
499 development”. The recent development of quantitative genetics modeling tools has triggered
500 research on the genetic and environmental determinism of traits, and on parental effects on
501 various phenotypic traits, including fitness components (Kruuk and Hill 2008; Kruuk et al. 2008;
502 Wilson et al. 2008; 2010). Quantitative genetics approaches will be useful to assess the extent to
503 which offspring traits can be attributed to their genetic background and position in the pedigree,
504 to environmental conditions, to non-nuclear genetic maternal effects, and to non-genetic parental
505 features (Clutton-Brock and Sheldon 2010; Lynch and Walsh 1998). For example, in the Lesser
506 Snow Goose, a species with substantial variation in gosling size according to feeding conditions
507 in the rearing habitat (Cooch et al. 1991; 1993), Cooch (2002) hypothesized that “selection may
508 operate on the environmental component of body size, not on additive genetic variance of body
509 size”. Future studies will benefit from recent methodological development of statistical models
510 combining the quantitative genetics ‘animal model’ (Postma and Charmantier 2006) and capture-
511 mark-recapture models (i.e., model designed to handle missing data resulting from non-detection
512 of animals that are alive and present in the study area; Papaix et al. 2010).

513 The growing interest in evolutionary ecology and quantitative genetics is drawing
514 attention to maternal effects (e.g., Potti 1999; Reinhold 2002). If early conditions are commonly
515 defined as depending on the habitat and the parents, data are missing on maternal (or parental)
516 effects in long-lived birds except in physiological studies of transfers from mother to offspring
517 via egg composition (Boulinier and Staszewski 2008; Gasparini et al. 2007). Nevertheless, as

518 shown by Lewis et al. (2006), some measurable behavioral criteria can be used to assess the
519 ‘quality’ of parental care and its relationship with parental fitness. It should be possible to address
520 its repeatability during the parent’s life, and its long-term consequences on fitness of young raised
521 to independence.

522 The scarcity of long-term studies of parental effects in long-lived birds may be explained
523 by the ‘age’ of studies of wild birds: still insufficient to work with the pedigree of population in
524 most cases (how long does it take to have data from at least two generations of animals whose
525 mean longevity is 10, 15 years, or more?). Nevertheless, maternal effects have been suggested to
526 play a central part in the dynamics of small mammal populations (including non-cycling
527 populations; Inchausti and Ginzburg 2009; Plaistow and Benton 2009; Rossiter 1994). They have
528 been documented in several wild large mammals (Wilson and Festa-Bianchet 2009). As explained
529 by Benton et al. (2005) “Differential provisioning of offspring is a widespread phenomenon that
530 has important consequences for offspring fitness [...]. The transmission of maternal quality to
531 offspring probably also has population dynamical consequences, because it leads to a time lag
532 between the environment and the population response. In the presence of environmental
533 fluctuations, the lag created by the delayed life-history effect typically also increases population
534 variability and decreases its predictability”. This type of lagged dynamical phenomenon exists in
535 long-lived birds (Thomson and Ollason 2001), but whether it is common is still unknown.

536 ***CONCLUSION***

537 There is growing interest in long-lasting effects of early development in a variety of taxa,
538 encouraged by conclusive results obtained in humans (the ‘Barker Hypothesis’ in 1994, or
539 hypotheses based on long-term effects of exposure to infectious diseases; Bengtsson and
540 Lindström 2000). However, as emphasized by Festa-Bianchet et al. (2000) concerning large
541 mammals “it is often assumed but seldom quantified that early conditions have long-term effects

542 on fitness. The underlying assumption is that there is a relatively strong correlation between
543 morphological, physiological, or behavioral characteristics of offspring and lifetime reproductive
544 success". Due to rarity of relevant data sets, too few studies of long-lived birds have addressed
545 the consequences of conditions during early development on fitness components over the
546 reproductive life, and lifetime reproductive success (but see Van de Pol et al. 2006 a). Whether
547 these conditions have long-term fitness consequences is still ambiguous: some studies have
548 shown that initially disadvantaged individuals do not incur long-term costs of energetic stress for
549 example (Drummond et al. 2003), or that early mortality in such individuals leads to rapid
550 disappearance from the population (Braash et al. 2009; Nevoux et al. 2010). In contrast some
551 others have found substantial lifetime reproductive success consequences of conditions during
552 development (Cam et al. 2003), including via access to higher-quality territories (Van de Pol et al.
553 2006 a). Evidence from large mammals suggests substantial long-term individual and population
554 effects of early conditions (Saether 1997; Kruuk et al. 1999), including trans-generational
555 maternal effects. Evidence from short-lived birds also suggests long-term individual
556 consequences (e.g., Gorman and Nager 2004), and maternal effects have been documented in
557 long-lived ones. Despite logistical and financial difficulties inherent in long-term studies, they are
558 the only way of addressing Lindström's second statement.

559 Existing long-term longitudinal data sets should be re-analyzed using recently developed
560 capture-mark-recapture models handling state uncertainty and unobservable heterogeneity in
561 populations (e.g., Gimenez and Choquet 2010; Pradel 2005). For example, it may be worth
562 evaluating whether some of the unique studies of reproductive success included in books edited
563 by Tim Clutton-Brock (1988) and lifetime reproduction in birds by Ian Newton (1989) have
564 continued and can provide new insight into the fate of the offspring of the individuals studied at
565 that time. One of the most difficult challenges for future studies will be determining whether
566 ontogeny and conditions experienced between independence and recruitment override the

567 influence of conditions during early development, or if individuals growing under unfavorable
 568 conditions disappear from the population before recruitment, or both. Although demanding,
 569 when possible ongoing studies of long-lived species should use a large number of criteria to
 570 characterize ‘early conditions’, i.e., not restricted to physical conditions (weather), food
 571 availability, morphological, physiological or phenological criteria; data characterizing the ‘quality’
 572 of parental care should also be collected (experience, dominance status, pair coordination, e.g.,
 573 Lewis et al. 2006). To assess the full range of conditions experienced before full developmental
 574 maturity, when possible, they should use a multi-disciplinary approach and address changes in
 575 individual behavior during the pre-breeding stages (prospection, habitat choice, dominance, pair
 576 formation), and characterize the social context (e.g., Van de Pol et al. 2007). In the near future
 577 electronic devices may also help collect information from individuals during the extended pre-
 578 breeding stage in a larger range of species (Bogdanova et al. 2011; Dittman and Becker 2003).
 579 Last, statistical methods designed to estimate lifetime reproductive success or incorporate
 580 pedigree information in standard situations of studies of wild vertebrates with imperfect
 581 detection probability (Papaix et al. 2010; Rouan et al. 2009) offer new opportunities to assess
 582 long-term fitness consequences of early development in long-lived birds.

583 ***ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS***

584 We are very grateful to Franz Bairlein for his incommensurable patience, and to Peter Becker and
 585 an anonymous referee for helping improve this manuscript. The Institut für Vogelforschung
 586 (‘Vogelwarte Helgoland’) provided support to participate in the Centenary meeting (April 2010,
 587 Wilhelmshaven, Germany).

588 ***LITERATURE CITED***

589 Albon SD, Clutton-Brock TH, Guinness FE (1987) Early development and population dynamics
 590 in red deer. II. Density-independent effects and cohort variation. *J Anim Ecol* 56: 69-81

- 591 Arnason AN (1973) The estimation of population size, migration rates and survival in a stratified
592 population. *Res Pop Ecol* 15: 1-8
- 593 Ashmole NP, Humberto TS (1968) Prolonged parental care in Royal terns and other birds. *Auk*
594 85: 90-100
- 595 Aubry LM, Cam E, Monnat J-Y (2009 a) Habitat selection, age-specific recruitment and
596 reproductive success in a long-lived seabird, the black-legged kittiwake. *Modeling*
597 *Demographic Processes in Marked Populations. Environ Ecol Stat* 3: 365-392
- 598 Aubry LM., Koons DN, Monnat J-Y, Cam E (2009 b) Consequences of recruitment decisions
599 and heterogeneity on age-specific breeding success in a long-lived seabird. *Ecology* 90:
600 2491–2502
- 601 Aubry LM, Cam E, Koons DN, Monnat J-Y, Pavard S (2011) Drivers of age-specific survival in a
602 long-lived seabird: contributions of observed and hidden sources of heterogeneity. *J*
603 *Anim Ecol* 80: 375–383
- 604 Authier M, Cam E, Guinet C (2011) Selection for increased body length in Subantarctic fur seals
605 on Amsterdam Island. *J Evol Biol* in press
- 606 Barbraud C, Johnson AR, Bertault G (2003) Phenotypic correlates of post-fledging dispersal in a
607 population of greater flamingos: the importance of body condition. *J Anim Ecol* 72: 246-
608 257
- 609 Barker DJP (1994) *Mothers, babies and disease in later life*. BMJ Publishing, London, U.K.
- 610 Bateson P, Barker D, Clutton-Brock T, Deb D, D’Udine B, Foley RA, Gluckman P, Godfrey K,
611 Kirkwood T, Mirazón Lahr M, McNamara J, Metcalfe NB, Monaghan P, Spenser HG,
612 and Sultan SE (2004) Developmental plasticity and human health. *Nature* 430: 419–421
- 613 Becker PH, Dittmann T, Ludwigs J-D, Limmer B, Ludwig SC, Bauch C, Braasch A, Wendeln H
614 (2008) Timing of initial arrival at the breeding site predicts age at first reproduction in a
615 long-lived migratory bird. *PNAS* 105: 12349-12352

- 616 Beckerman A, Benton TG, Ranta E, Kaitala V, Lundberg P (2002) Population dynamic
617 consequences of delayed life-history effects. *Trends Ecol Evol* 17: 263–269
- 618 Belthoff JR, Duffy AM (1998) Corticosterone, body condition and locomotor activity: a model
619 for dispersal in screech-owls. *Anim Behav* 55: 405-415
- 620 Bengtsson T, Lindström M (2000) Childhood misery and disease in later life: the effects on
621 mortality in old age of hazards experienced in early life, southern Sweden, 1760-1894.
622 *Popul Stud* 54: 263-277
- 623 Benton TG, Plaistow SJ, Beckerman AP, Lapsley CT, Littlejohns S (2005) Changes in maternal
624 investment in eggs can affect population dynamics. *Proc R Soc Lond B* 272: 1351–135
- 625 Benton TG, Plaistow S J, Coulson T N (2006) Complex population dynamics and complex
626 causations: devils, details and demography. *Proc R Soc Lond B*. 273: 1173-1181
- 627 Bergeron P, Baeta R, Pelletier F, Réale D, Garant D (2010) Individual quality: tautology or
628 biological reality? *J Anim Ecol* 80: 361-364
- 629 Bize P, Roulin A, Richner H (2002) Covariation between egg size and rearing condition
630 determines offspring quality: an experiment with the Alpine Swift. *Oecologia* 132: 231–
631 234
- 632 Blas,J, Bortolotti GR, Tella JL, Baos R, Marchant TA (2007) Stress response during
633 development predicts fitness in a wild, long lived vertebrate. *Proc Natl Acad Science USA*
634 104: 8880-8884
- 635 Blount JD, Metcalf NB, Arnold KE, Surai PF, Devereay GL, Monaghan P (2003) Neonatal
636 nutrition, adult antioxidant defenses and sexual attractiveness in the Zebra finch. *Proc R*
637 *Soc Lond B* 270: 1691-1693
- 638 Boag PT (1987) Effects of nestling diet on growth and adult size of zebra finches (*Poephila*
639 *gutkata*). *Auk* 104: 155–166
- 640 Boersma PD (1982) Why some birds take so long to hatch. *Am Nat* 120: 733–750

- 641 Bogdanova MI, Daunt F, Newell M, Phillips RA, Harris MP, Wanless S (2011) Seasonal
642 interactions in the black-legged kittiwake *Rissa tridactyla*: links between breeding
643 performance and winter distribution. Proc R Soc Lond B (published online) doi:
644 10.1098/rspb.2010.2601
- 645 Boulinier T, Staswki V (2008) Maternal transfer of antibodies: raising immuno-ecology issues.
646 Trends Ecol Evol 23: 202-288
- 647 Both C, Visser ME, Verboven N (1999) Density-dependent recruitment rates in great tits: the
648 importance of being heavier. Proc R Soc Lond B 266: 465-469
- 649 Braasch A, Schaub C, Becker PH (2009) Post-fledging body mass as a determinant of subadult
650 survival in Common Terns *Sterna hirundo*. J Ornithol 150:401–407
- 651 Bruinzeel LW, van de Pol M (2002) Site attachment of floaters predicts success in territory
652 acquisition. Behav Ecol 15: 290–296
- 653 Burger J (1980) The transition to independence and post-fledging parental care in seabirds. In:
654 Burger J, Olla BL, and Winn HE (eds) Behavior of marine animals 4. Marine birds.
655 Plenum press, New York, pp 367-447
- 656 Burness GP, McClelland GB, Wardrop SL, Hochachka PW (2000) Effect of brood size
657 manipulation on offspring physiology: and experiment with passerine birds. J Exp Biol
658 203: 3513–3520
- 659 Cam E, Link W A, Cooch EG, Monnat J-Y, Danchin E (2002 a) Individual covariation in life-
660 history traits: seeing the trees despite the forest. Am Nat 159 : 96–105
- 661 Cam E, Cadiou B, Hines JE, Monnat J-Y (2002 b) Influence of behavioural tactics on
662 recruitment and reproductive trajectory in the Kittiwake. J App Stats 29: 163-185
- 663 Cam E, Monnat J-Y, Hines JE (2003) Long-term consequences of early conditions in the
664 kittiwake. JAnim Ecol 72: 411-424
- 665 Cam E, Cooch E, and Monnat J-Y (2005) Earlier recruitment or earlier death? On the assumption
666 of homogeneous survival in recruitment studies. Ecol Monogr 75: 419-434

- 667 Cameron TC, Benton TG (2004) Stage-structured harvesting and its effects: an empirical
668 investigation using soil mites. *J Anim Ecol* 73: 996–1006
- 669 Cadiou B, Monnat J-Y, Danchin E (1994) Prospecting in the Kittiwake, *Rissa tridactyla*. different
670 behavioural patterns and the role of squatting in recruitment. *Anim Behav* 47: 847- 856
- 671 Cadiou B (1999) Attendance of breeders and prospectors reflects the quality of colonies in the
672 Kittiwake *Rissa tridactyla*. *Ibis* 141: 321- 326
- 673 Cappé O, Moulines E, Rydén T (2005) Inference in Hidden Markov Models. Springer
674 Science+Business Media Inc. New York, U.S.A. 624 pages.
- 675 Carere C, Drent PJ, Privitera L, Koolhaas JM, Groothuis TGG (2005) Personalities in great tits,
676 *Parus major*. Stability and consistency. *Anim Behav* 70: 795-805
- 677 Chabrzyk G, Coulson JC (1976) Survival and recruitment in the herring gull (*Larus argentatus*). *J*
678 *Anim Ecol* 45: 187-203
- 679 Charlesworth B (1994) Evolution in age structured populations. Second Edition. Cambridge
680 University Press, Cambridge, UK. 324 pages
- 681 Charmantier A, Perrins C, McCleery RH, Sheldon BC (2006 a) Evolutionary response to
682 selection on clutch size in a long-term study of the mute swan. *Am Nat* 167: 453-465
- 683 Charmantier A, Perrins C, McCleery RH, Sheldon BC (2006 b) Age-dependent genetic variance
684 in a life-history trait in the mute swan. *Proc R Soc Lond B* 273: 225-232
- 685 Choquet R, Rouan L, Pradel R (2009) Program E-SURGE: a software application for fitting
686 Multievent models. *Environ Ecol Stats* 3: 845-865
- 687 Choudhury S, Black JM, and Owen M (1992) Lessons from a long-term study. *Anim Behav* 44:
688 171-173
- 689 Christensen T K (1999) Effects of cohort and individual variation in duckling body condition on
690 survival and recruitment in the Common Eider *Somateria mollissima*. *J Avian Biol* 30: 302–
691 308

- 692 Clutton-Brock TH (1988) Reproductive success. The University of Chicago Press, Chicago,
693 U.S.A. 538 pages
- 694 Cooch EG, Lank DB, Dzubin A, Rockwell RF, and Cooke F (1991) Body size variation in lesser
695 snow geese: environmental plasticity in gosling growth rates. *Ecology* 72: 503-512
- 696 Cooch EG, Jefferies RL, Rockwell RF, and Cooke F (1993) Environmental change and the cost
697 of philopatry: an example in the lesser snow goose. *Oecologia* 93: 128-138
- 698 Cooch EG (2002) Fledging size and survival in snow geese: timing is everything (or is it?). *J Appl*
699 *Stats* 29: 143-162
- 700 Clutton-Brock TH, and Sheldon BC (2010) Individuals and populations: the role of long-term,
701 individual-based studies of animals in ecology and evolutionary biology. *Trends Ecol*
702 *Evol* 1284: 1-12.
- 703 Crespin L, Harris MP, Lebreton J-D, Frederiksen M, and Wanless S (2006) Recruitment to a
704 seabird population depends on environmental factors and population size. *J Anim Ecol*
705 75: 228-238
- 706 Croxall JP, Rothery P, Pickering SPC., and Price PA (1990) Reproductive performance,
707 recruitment and survival of wandering albatrosses *Diomedea exulans* at Bird Island, South
708 Georgia. *J Anim Ecol* 59: 775-796
- 709 Danchin E, Cadiou B, Monnat J-Y, and Rodriguez Estrella R (1991) Recruitment in long-lived
710 birds: conceptual framework and behavioural mechanisms. *Proc Inter Ornithol Congr* 20:
711 1641-1656
- 712 de Kogel CH, and Puijs H J (1996) Effects of brood size manipulations on sexual attractiveness
713 of offspring in the zebra finch. *Anim Behav* 51: 699-708
- 714 de Kogel CH (1997) Long-term effects of brood size manipulation on morphological
715 development and sex-specific mortality of offspring. *J Anim Ecol* 66, 167-178
- 716 Dingemanse NJ, Both C, Drent PJ, and Tinbergen JM (2004) Fitness consequences of avian
717 personalities in a fluctuating environment. *Proc R Soc Lond B* 271: 847-852

- 718 Dingemanse N, and Réale D (2005) Natural selection and animal personality. *Behaviour* 142:
719 1165-1190
- 720 Dittmann T, and Becker PH (2003) Sex, age, experience and condition as factors affecting arrival
721 date in prospecting common terns, *Sterna hirundo*. *Anim Behav* 65: 981-986
- 722 Dittmann T, Zinsmeister D, and Becker PH (2005) Dispersal decisions: common terns, *Sterna*
723 *hirundo*, choose between colonies during prospecting. *Anim Behav* 70: 13-20
- 724 Dittmann T, Ezard THG, and Becker PH (2007) Prospectors' colony attendance is sex-specific
725 and increases recruitment chances in a seabird. *Behav Process* 76: 198-205
- 726 Dijkstra C, Bult A, Bijlsma S, Daan S, Meijer T, and Zijlstra M (1990) Brood size manipulation in
727 the kestrel (*Falco tinnunculus*): effects on offspring and parent survival. *J Anim Ecol* 59:
728 269-285
- 729 Doblhammer G, and Vaupel JW (2001) Lifespan depends on month of birth. *Proc Natl Acad*
730 *Sci USA* 98: 2934-2939
- 731 Drent PJ (1983) The functional ethology of territoriality in the great tit (*Parus major* L.). Ph. D.
732 thesis. University of Groningen
- 733 Drent PJ, Van Oers K, and Van Noordwijk AJ (2003) Realized heritability of personalities in the
734 great tit (*Parus major*). *Proc R Soc Lond B* 270: 45-51
- 735 Drummond H, Torres R, Krishnan VV (2003) Buffered development: resilience after aggressive
736 subordination in infancy. *Am Nat* 161: 794-807
- 737 Dupuis JA (1995) Bayesian estimation of movement and survival probabilities from capture-
738 recapture data. *Biometrika* 82: 761-772
- 739 Eising CM, Müller W, and Groothuis TGG (2006) Avian mothers create different phenotypes by
740 hormone deposition in their eggs. *Biol Lett* 2: 20-22
- 741 Erikstad KE, Fauchald P, Tveraa T, and Steen H (1998) On the cost of reproduction in long-
742 lived birds: the influence of environmental variability. *Ecol* 79: 1781-1788

- 743 Fear CJ (2002) Influence of date and body mass at fledging on long-term survival of sooty terns
744 *Sterna fuscata*. Mar Ornithol 30: 46-47
- 745 Festa-Bianchet M, Jorgenson JT, and Réale D (2000) Effects of early development and maternal
746 mass on adult mass and reproductive success in bighorn sheep. Behav Ecol 11: 633-639
- 747 Finch CE, and Crimmins EM (2004) Inflammatory exposure and historical changes in Human
748 life-spans. Science 305: 1736-1739.
- 749 Forchhammer MC, Clutton-Brock TH, Lindstrom J, and Albon, SD (2001) Climate and
750 population density induce long-term cohort variation in a northern ungulate. J Anim Ecol
751 70:721–729
- 752 Fox GA, and Kendall BE (2002) Demographic stochasticity and the variance reduction effect.
753 Ecol 83: 1928–1934
- 754 Franceschi C, Bonafè M, Valensin S, Olivieri F, de Luca M, Ottaviani, E and de Benedictis G
755 (2000) Inflamm-aging: an evolutionary perspective on immunosenescence. Annals N Y
756 Acad Sci 908: 244-254
- 757 Gaillard J-M, Festa-Bianchet M, Yoccoz NG, Loison A, and Toigo C (2000) Temporal variation
758 in fitness components and population dynamics of large herbivores. Annu Rev Ecol Syst
759 31:367–393
- 760 Garnett MC (1981) Body size, its heritability and influence on juvenile survival among great tits,
761 *Parus major*. Ibis 123:31–41
- 762 Gasparini J, Boulinier T, Gill VA, Gil D, Hatch SA, and Roulin A (2007) Food availability affects
763 the maternal transfer of androgens and antibodies into eggs of a colonial seabird. J Evol
764 Biol 20: 874–880
- 765 Gimenez O, and Choquet R (2010) Individual heterogeneity in studies on marked animals using
766 numerical integration: capture–recapture mixed models. Ecology 91: 951–957
- 767 Gorman HE, and Nager RG (2004) Prenatal developmental conditions have long-term effects on
768 offspring fecundity. Proc R Soc Lond B 271: 1923-1928

- 769 Groothuis TGG, Eising C, Dijkstra C, and Müller W (2005) Balancing between costs and
770 benefits of maternal hormone deposition in avian eggs. *Biol Lett* 1: 78–81
- 771 Gustafsson L, and Sutherland WL (1988) The costs of reproduction in the collared flycatcher
772 *Ficedula albicollis*. *Nature* 335: 813-817
- 773 Hall AJ, McConnell BJ, and Barker RJ (2001) Factors affecting first-year survival in grey seals and
774 their implications for life history strategy. *J Anim Ecol* 70: 138–149
- 775 Halley DJ, Harris MP, and Wanless S (1995). Colony attendance and recruitment in immature
776 Common mures (*Uria aalge*). *Auk* 112: 947-957
- 777 Hario M, and Rintala J (2009) Age of first breeding in the Common Eider *Somateria m. mollissima*
778 population in the northern Baltic Sea. *Ornis Fennica* 86:81–88
- 779 Harris MP, Halley DJ, Wanless S (1992) The post-fledging survival of young guillemots *Uria aalge*
780 in relation to hatching date and growth. *Ibis* 134: 335–339
- 781 Harris MP, Buckland ST, Russell SM, and Wanless S (1994) Post fledging survival to breeding age
782 of shags *Phalacrocorax aristotelis* in relation to year, date of fledging and brood size. *J Avian*
783 *Biol* 25: 268-274
- 784 Harris MP, Halley DJ, and Wanless S (2008) Post-fledging survival of young Guillemots *Uria*
785 *aalge* in relation to hatching date and growth. *Ibis* 134: 335-339
- 786 Harrison XA, Blount JD, Inger R, Norris DR, and Bearhop S (2011) Carry-over effects as drivers
787 of fitness differences in animals. *J Anim Ecol* 80: 4-18
- 788 Haywood S, and Perrins CM (1992) Is clutch size in birds affected by environmental conditions
789 during growth? *Proc R Soc Lond B* 249: 195-197
- 790 Hedgren S (1981) Effects of fledging weight and time of fledging on survival of guillemot *Uria*
791 *aalge* chicks. *Ornis Scandinavica* 12: 51–54
- 792 Heinsohn RG (1991) Slow learning of foraging skills and extended parental care in cooperative
793 breeding White-Winged choughs. *Am Nat* 137: 864-881

- 794 Hamel S, Gaillard J-M, Festa-Bianchet M, and Côté SD (2009) Individual quality, early-life
795 conditions, and reproductive success in contrasted populations of large herbivores.
796 Ecology 90: 1981–1995
- 797 Hawkes K (2010) How grandmother effects plus individual variation in frailty shape fertility and
798 mortality: Guidance from human–chimpanzee comparisons. Proc Natl Acad Sci USA
799 107: 8977–8984
- 800 Hénau V, Bregnballe T, and Lebreton J-D (2007) Dispersal and recruitment during population
801 growth in a colonial bird, the great cormorant *Phalacrocorax carbo sinensis*. J Avian Biol 38:
802 44–57
- 803 Henry CJK, and Ulijaszek SJ (1996) Long-term consequences of early environment. Cambridge
804 University Press, Cambridge U.K.
- 805 Hestbeck JB, Nichols JD, and Malecki RA (1991) Estimates of movement and site fidelity using
806 mark-resight data of wintering Canada geese. Ecology 72:523–533
- 807 Hipfner JM (1999) Fitness-related consequences of relaying in an Arctic seabird: survival of
808 offspring to recruitment age. Auk 118: 1076–1080
- 809 Jones HJ, Wilson ML, Muray C, and Pusey A (2010) Phenotypic quality influences fertility in
810 Gombe chimpanzees. J Anim Ecol 79:1262–1269
- 811 Inchausti P, and Ginzburg LR (2009) Maternal effects mechanism of population cycling: a
812 formidable competitor to the traditional predator-prey view. Philos Trans R Soc Lond B
813 364: 1117–1124
- 814 Jenouvrier S, Tavecchia G, Thibault J-C, Choquet R, and Bretagnolle V (2008) Recruitment
815 processes in long-lived species with delayed maturity: Estimating key demographic
816 parameters. Oikos 117: 620–628
- 817 Kendall B, and Fox GA 2002. Individual variability reduces demographic stochasticity. Conser
818 Biol 16: 109–116

- 819 Kendall WL (2004) Copying with unobservable and mis-classified states in capture-recapture
820 studies. *Anim Biodivers Conserv* 27: 97–107
- 821 Klomp NI, and Furness RW (1992) Non-breeders as a buffer against environmental stress:
822 declines in numbers of great skuas on Foula, Shetland, and predictions of future
823 recruitment. *J App Ecol* 29: 341-348
- 824 Koenig WD, Vuren DV, and Hooge PH (1996) Detectability, philopatry, and the distribution of
825 dispersal distances in vertebrates. *Trends Ecol Evol* 11: 514-517
- 826 Kontiainen P, Brommer JE, Karell P, and Pietiäinen H (2007) Heritability, plasticity and
827 canalization of Ural owl egg size in a cyclic environment. *J Evol Biol* 21: 88-96
- 828 Korpimäki E, and Lagerström M (1988) Survival and natal dispersal of fledging of Tengmalm's
829 owl in relation to fluctuating food conditions and hatching date. *J Anim Ecol* 57: 433-441
- 830 Krause ET, Honarmand M, Wetzel J, and Nagui BM (2009) Early fasting is long-lasting:
831 differences in early nutritional conditions reappear under stressful conditions in adult
832 female zebra finches. *Plos One* 4: 1-6
- 833 Kruuk LEB, Clutton-Brock TH, Rose KE and Guinness FE (1999) Early determinants of
834 lifetime reproductive success differ between the sexes in red deer. *Proc R Soc Lond B*
835 266:1655-1661
- 836 Kruuk LEB and Hill WG (2008) Evolutionary dynamics of wild populations: the use of long-
837 term pedigree data. *P R Soc Lond B*.275:593-596
- 838 Kruuk LEB, Slate J, and Wilson AJ (2008) New answers for old questions: the evolutionary
839 quantitative genetics of wild animal populations. *Annu Rev Ecol Evol Syst* 39: 525-548
- 840 Lailvaux SP, and Kasumovic MM (2011) Defining individual quality over lifetimes and selective
841 contexts. *Proc R Soc Lond B* 278: 321-328
- 842 Larsson K, and Forslund P (1987) Environmentally induced morphological variation in the
843 barnacle goose (*Branta leucopsis*). *J Evol Biol* 4: 619-636

- 844 Larsson K (1993) Inheritance of body size in the barnacle goose under different environmental
845 conditions. *J Evol Biol* 6: 195-208
- 846 Larsson K, and Forslund P (1992) Genetic and social inheritance of body and egg size in the
847 barnacle goose (*Branta leucopsis*). *Evolution* 46: 235-244
- 848 Lendvai AZ, Loiseau C, Sorci G, and Chastel O (2009) Early developmental conditions affect
849 stress response in juvenile but not in adult house sparrows (*Passer domesticus*). *General and*
850 *Comparative Endocrinology* 160: 30-35
- 851 Lewis S, Wanless S, Elston DA, Schultz MD, Mackley E, Du Toit M, Underhill JG, and Harris
852 MP (2006) Determinants of quality in a long-lived colonial species. *J Anim Ecol* 75: 1304-
853 1312
- 854 Limmer B, and Becker PH (2009) Improvement in chick provisioning with parental experience in
855 a seabird. *Anim Behav* 77:1095-1101
- 856 Limmer B, and Becker PH (2010) Improvement of reproductive performance with age and
857 breeding experience depends on recruitment age in a long-lived seabird. *Oikos* 119: 500-
858 507
- 859 Lindén M, Gustafsson L, and Pärt T (1992) Selection on Fledging Mass in the Collared
860 Flycatcher and the Great Tit. *EcologyEcol* 73: 336-383
- 861 Lindström J (1999) Early development and fitness in birds and mammals. *Trends Ecol Evol* 14:
862 343-347
- 863 Link WA, Cooch EG, and Cam E (2002) Model-based estimation of individual fitness. *J App*
864 *Stats* 29: 207-224
- 865 Lloyd CS (1979) Factors affecting breeding of razorbills *Alca torda* on Skokholm. *Ibis* 121: 165-
866 176
- 867 Loison A, Solberg EJ, Yoccoz NG, and Langvatn R (2004) Sex differences in the interplay of
868 cohort and mother quality on body mass of red deer calves. *Ecology* 85:1992-2002

- 869 Ludwigs J-D, and Becker PH (2006) Individual quality and recruitment in the common tern,
870 *Sterna hirundo*. *Acta Zool Sin* 52: 96–100
- 871 Lynch M, and Walsh B (1998) *Genetics and Analysis of Quantitative Traits*. Sinauer, Sunderland,
872 MA
- 873 Magrath RD (1991) Nestling mass and juvenile survival in the blackbird *Turdus Merula*. *J Anim*
874 *Ecol* 60: 335-351
- 875 Marzolin G (2002) Influence of the mating system of the Eurasian dipper on sex-specific local
876 survival rates. *J Wildl Manage* 66:1023–1030
- 877 Marzolin G, Charmantier A, and Gimenez O (2011) Frailty in state-space models: application to
878 actuarial senescence in the dipper. *Ecology* in press
- 879 Meathrel CE, Bradley JS, Wooller RD, and Skira IJ (1993) The effect of parental condition on
880 egg-size and reproductive success in short-tailed shearwaters *Puffinus tenuirostris*. *Oecologia*
881 93: 162–164
- 882 Meathrel CE, and Carey MJ (2007) How important are intrinsic factors to natal recruitment in
883 Short-tailed Shearwaters *Puffinus tenuirostris*? *J Ornithol* 148: 385–393
- 884 McDonald PG, Olsen PD, and Cockburn A (2005) Sex allocation and nestling survival in a
885 dimorphic raptor: does size matter? *Behav Ecol* 16: 922-930
- 886 Merilä J, and Svensson E (1997) Are fat reserves in migratory birds affected by condition in early
887 life? *J Avian Biol* 28: 279-286
- 888 Merilä J, Kruuk LEB, and Sheldon BC (2001) Natural selection on the genetical component of
889 variance in body condition in a wild bird population. *J Evol Biol* 14: 918-929
- 890 Metcalfe NB and Monaghan P (2001) Compensation for a bad start: grow now, pay later. *Trends*
891 *Ecol Evol* 16: 254-260
- 892 Metcalfe NB and Monaghan P (2003) Growth versus lifespan: perspectives from evolutionary
893 ecology. *Exp Gerontol* 38: 935-940

- 894 Moe SJ, Stenseth NC, Smith RH (2002) Density dependent compensation in blowfly populations
895 give indirectly positive effects of a toxicant. *Ecology* 83: 1597–1603
- 896 Morrison KW, Hipfner JM, Gjerdrum C, and Green DJ (2009) Wing length and mass at fledging
897 predict local juvenile survival and age at first return in tufted puffins. *Condor* 111: 433-
898 441
- 899 Mougín J-L, Jouanin C, Roux F, and Zino F (2000) Fledging weight and juvenile survival of
900 Cory's shearwaters *Calonectris diomedea* on Selvagem Grande. *Ringing Migr* 20: 107–110
- 901 Müller W, Vergauwen J, and Eens M (2009) Long-lasting consequences of elevated yolk
902 testosterone levels on female reproduction. *Behav Ecol Sociobiol* 63: 809–816
- 903 Naef-Daenzer B, Widmer F, and Nuber M (2001) Differential post-fledging survival of great and
904 coal tits in relation to their condition and fledging date. *J Anim Ecol* 70: 730-738
- 905 Nager R, Monaghan P, Houston DC, and Genovart M (2000) Parental condition, brood sex ratio
906 and differential young survival: and experimental study in gulls (*Larus fuscus*). *Behav Ecol*
907 *Sociobiol* 48: 452-457
- 908 Nager RP, Monaghan P, Houston DC, Arnold KE, Blount JD, Verboven N (2006) Maternal
909 effects through the avian egg. *Acta Zool Sin* 52:658–661
- 910 Nevoux M, Weimerskirch H, and Barbraud C (2010) Long- and short-term influence of
911 environment on recruitment in a species with highly delayed maturity. *Oecologia* 162:
912 383-392
- 913 Nelson DA (1987) Factors influencing colony attendance by Pigeon Guillemots on southeast
914 Farallon Island, California. *Condor* 89: 430-448
- 915 Newton I (1989) *Lifetime Reproduction in Birds*. Academic Press, London, 479 pages
- 916 Nichols JD, and Kendall WL (1995) The use of multi-state capture–recapture models to address
917 questions in evolutionary ecology. *J Appl Stats* 22: 835–846
- 918 Nussey DH, Kruuk LEB, Morris A, and Clutton-Brock TH (2007) Environmental conditions in
919 early life influence ageing rates in a wild population of red deer. *Curr Biol* 17: 1000-1001

- 920 Papaix J, Cubaynes S, Buoro M, Charmantier A, Perret P, and Gimenez O (2010) Combining
921 capture-recapture data and pedigree information to assess heritability of demographic
922 parameters in the wild. *J Evol Biol* 23: 2176-84
- 923 Pikerling SPC (1989) Attendance pattern and behaviour in relation to experience and pair-bond
924 formation in the wandering albatross *Diomedea exulans* at South Georgia. *Ibis* 131:183-195
- 925 Perrins CM (1965) Population fluctuations and clutch-size in the great tit *Parus major*. *J Anim*
926 *Ecol* 34: 601–647
- 927 Perrins CM, Harris MP, and Britton CK (1973) Survival of manx shearwaters *Puffinus puffinus*. *Ibis*
928 115:535–548
- 929 Plaistow SJ and Benton TG (2009) The influence of context-dependent maternal effects on
930 population dynamics: an experimental test. *Philos Trans R Soc Lond B* 364: 1049-1058
- 931 Potti J (1999) Maternal effects and the pervasive impact of nestling history on egg size in a
932 passerine bird. *Evolution* 53: 279-285
- 933 Postma E, and Charmantier A (2007) What ‘animal models’ can and cannot tell ornithologists
934 about the genetics of wild populations. *J Ornithol* 148: 633-642
- 935 Pradel R (2005) Multievent: an extension of multistate capture-recapture models to uncertain
936 states. *Biometrics* 61: 442-447
- 937 Réale D, and Festa-Bianchet M (2003) Natural selection on temperament in bighorn ewes. *Anim*
938 *Behav* 65: 463-470
- 939 Reed ET, Gauthier G, Pradel R, and Lebreton J-D (2003) Age and environmental conditions
940 affect recruitment in greater snow geese. *Ecology* 84: 219-203
- 941 Reid JM, Bignal EM, Bignal S, McCracken DI, and Monaghan P (2003) Environmental
942 variability, life-history covariation and cohort effects in the red-billed chough *Pyrrhocorax*
943 *pyrrhocorax*. *J Anim Ecol* 72: 36–46
- 944 Reid JM, Bignal EM, Bignal S, McCracken DI, Bogdanova MI, and Monaghan P (2008)
945 Investigating patterns and processes of demographic variation: environmental correlated

- 946 of pre-breeding survival in red-billed choughs *Pyrhocorax pyrhocorax*. *J Anim Ecol* 77:
 947 777-788
- 948 Reinhold K (2002) Maternal effects and the evolution of behavioral and morphological
 949 characters: a literature review indicates the importance of extended maternal care. *J Hered*
 950 93 : 400-405
- 951 Richner H (1989) Habitat-specific growth and fitness in carrion crows (*Corvus corone corone*). *J*
 952 *Anim Ecol* 58: 427–440
- 953 Rose KE, Clutton-Brock TH, and Guinness FE (1999) Cohort variation in male survival and
 954 lifetime breeding success in red deer. *J Anim Ecol* 67: 979-986
- 955 Rossiter MC (1994) Maternal effects hypothesis of herbivore outbreak. *BioScience* 44:752–763.
- 956 Rouan L, Gaillard J-M, Guédon Y, and Pradel R (2009) Estimation of lifetime reproductive
 957 success when breeding status cannot always be assessed. *Environ Ecol Stats* 3: 867-879
- 958 Royle JA (2008) Modeling Individual Effects in the Cormack–Jolly–Seber Model: A State–Space
 959 Formulation. *Biometrics* 64:364–370
- 960 Rubolini D, Romano M, Martinelli R., Saino N (2006) Effects of elevated yolk testosterone levels
 961 on survival, growth and immunity of male and female yellow-legged gull chicks. *Behav*
 962 *Ecol Sociobiol* 59: 344–352
- 963 Sagar PM, Horning DS Jr (1998) Mass-related survival of fledgling sooty shearwaters *Puffinus*
 964 *griseus* at The Snares, New Zealand. *Ibis* 140: 329–331
- 965 Saether BE (1997) Environmental stochasticity and population dynamics of large herbivores: a
 966 search for mechanisms. *Trends Ecol Evol* 12: 143-149
- 967 Schlutter D, and Gustafsson L (1993) Maternal inheritance of condition and clutch size in the
 968 collared flycatcher. *Evolution* 47: 658-667
- 969 Schreiber EA, Doherty Jr PF, and Schenk GA (2004) Dispersal and survival rates of adult and
 970 juvenile red-tailed tropicbirds (*Phaeton rubricauda*) exposed to potential contaminants.
 971 *Anim Biodivers Cons* 27: 531-540

- 972 Schwarz CJ, Schweigert JF, and Arnason AN (1993) Estimating migration rates using tag-
973 recovery data. *Biometrics* 49: 177-189
- 974 Sedinger JS, Flint PL, and Lindberg MS (1995) Environmental influence on life-history traits:
975 growth, survival and fecundity in black brant (*Branta bernicla*). *Ecol* 76: 2404-2414
- 976 Sedinger JS, Herzog MP, and Ward DH (2004) Early environmental and recruitment in black
977 brant (*Branta bernicla nigricans*). *Auk* 121: 68-73
- 978 Solberg EJ, Loison A, Gaillard JM, and Heim M (2004) Lasting effects of conditions at birth on
979 moose body mass. *Ecography* 27: 677–687
- 980 Spear L, and Nur N (1994) Brood size, hatching order and hatching date: effects on four life-
981 history stages from hatching to recruitment in western gulls. *J Anim Ecol* 63: 283-298
- 982 Spear L, Sideman WJ, and Pyle P (1993) Factors affecting recruitment age and recruitment
983 probability in the Western Gull *Larus occidentalis*. *Ibis* 137: 352-359
- 984 Téplitsky C, Mills JA, Yarral JW and Merilä J (2008) Heritability of fitness components in a wild
985 bird population. *Evolution* 63-3: 716–726
- 986 Serventy DL (1967) Aspects of the population ecology of the shorttailed shearwater *Puffinus*
987 *tenuirostris*. *Proc Int Ornithol Congr* 14:165–190
- 988 Stamps J, and Groothuis TGG (2010) The development of animal personality: relevance,
989 concepts and perspectives. *Biol Rev* 85: 301–325
- 990 Stienen EWM, and Brenninkmeijer A (2002) Variation in growth in Sandwich Tern chicks *Sterna*
991 *sandvicensis* and the consequences for pre- and post-fledging mortality. *Ibis* 144: 576-576
- 992 Szép T, and Møller AP (1999) Exposure to ectoparasites increases within-brood variability in size
993 and body mass in sand martin. *Oecologia* 125: 201-207
- 994 Tinbergen JM, and Boelijst M C (1990) Nestling weight and survival in individual great tits (*Parus*
995 *major*). *J Anim Ecol* 59: 1113-1127

- 996 Thomas DW, Shipley B, Blondel J, Perret P, Simon A, and Lambrecht MM (2007) Common
 997 paths link food abundance and ectoparasite loads to physiological performance and
 998 recruitment in nestling blue tits. *Funct Ecol* 21: 947-955
- 999 Thompson PM, and Ollason JC (2001) Lagged effects of ocean climate change on fulmar
 1000 population dynamics. *Nature* 413:417–420
- 1001 Tobler M, and Sandell MI (2007) Yolk testosterone modulates persistence of neophobic
 1002 responses in adult zebra finches, *Taeniopygia guttata*. *Horm Behav* 52: 640-645
- 1003 Tschirren B, Fitze PS, and Richner H (2007) Maternal modulation of natal dispersal in a
 1004 passerine bird: an adaptive strategy to cope with parasitism? *Am Nat* 169: 87-93
- 1005 Ulijaszek SJ (1996) Long-term consequences of early environmental influences on human
 1006 growth: a developmental perspective. In: Henry CJK, and Ulijaszek SJ (eds) Long-term
 1007 consequences of early environment. Cambridge University Press. Cambridge, U.K. Pp 25-
 1008 43
- 1009 Van Noordwijk AJ, Van Balen JH, and Scharloo W (1988) Heritability of body size in a natural
 1010 population of the Great Tit (*Parus major*) and its relation to age and environmental
 1011 conditions during growth. *Genet Res* 51: 149-162
- 1012 Vergara P, Fargallo JA, and Martinez-Padilla J (2010) Reaching independence: food supply,
 1013 parent quality, and offspring phenotypic characters in kestrels. *Behav Ecol* 21: 507-512
- 1014 Verhulst S, Perrins CM, and Riddington R (1997) Natal dispersal of great tits in a patchy
 1015 environment. *Ecology* 78: 864–872
- 1016 van de Pol M, Bruinzeel LW, Heg D, Van der Jeugd HP, and Verhulst S (2006 a) A silver spoon
 1017 for a golden future: long-term effects of natal origin on fitness prospects of
 1018 oystercatchers (*Haematopus ostralegus*). *J Anim Ecol* 75: 616-626
- 1019 van de Pol M, Bakker T, Saaltink D J, and Verhulst S (2006 b) Rearing conditions determine
 1020 offspring survival independent of egg quality: a cross-foster experiment with
 1021 Oystercatchers *Haematopus ostralegus*. *Ibis* 148: 203–210

- 1022 van de Pol M, Pen I, Heg D, and Weissing FJ (2007) Variation in habitat choice and delayed
 1023 reproduction: adaptive queuing strategies or individual quality differences? *Am Nat* 170:
 1024 530–541
- 1025 van der Jeugd HP, and Larsson K (1998) Pre-breeding survival of barnacle geese *Branta leucopsis* in
 1026 relation to fledgling characteristics. *J Anim Ecol* 67: 953-966
- 1027 van Oers K, Drent PJ, de Goede P, and van Noordwijk AJ (2004 a) Repeatability and heritability
 1028 of risk-taking behaviour in relation to avian personalities. *Proc R Soc Lond B* 271: 65-71
- 1029 van Oers K, de Jong G, van Noordwijk AJ, Kempenaers B, and Drent PJ (2005) Contribution of
 1030 genetics to the study of animal personalities: a review of case studies. *Behaviour* 142:
 1031 1191-1212
- 1032 Vaupel JW, Manton KG, and Stallard E (1979) The impact of heterogeneity in individual frailty
 1033 on the dynamics of mortality. *Demography* 16: 439-454
- 1034 Vaupel JW, and Yashin AI (1985) The deviant dynamics of death in heterogeneous populations.
 1035 *Sociol Methodol* 14: 179–211
- 1036 Vergara P, Fargallo JA, and Martinez-Padilla J (2010) Reaching independence: food supply,
 1037 parent quality, and offspring phenotypic characters in kestrels. *Behav Ecol* 21: 507-512
- 1038 Viñuela J (1999) Sibling aggression, hatching asynchrony, and nestling mortality in the black kite
 1039 (*Milvus migrans*). *Behav Ecol Sociobiol* 45: 33-45
- 1040 Verboven N, and Visser ME (1998) Seasonal variation in local recruitment of great tits: the
 1041 important of being early. *Oikos* 81: 511-524
- 1042 Votier SC, Birkhead TR, Oro D, Trinder M, Grantham MJ, Clark JA, McCleery RH, and
 1043 Hatchwell BJ (2008) Recruitment and survival of immature seabirds in relation to oil spills
 1044 and climate variability. *J Anim Ecol* 77: 974-983
- 1045 Walling CA, Royle NJ, Metcalfe NB, and Lindström J (2007) Early nutritional conditions, growth
 1046 trajectories and mate choice: does compensatory growth lead to a reduction in adult
 1047 sexual attractiveness? *Behav Ecol Sociobiol* 61: 1007-1014

- 1048 Watson MJ, and Hatch JJ (1999) Differences in foraging performance between juvenile and adult
1049 Roseate terns at a pre-migratory staging area. *Waterbirds* 22: 463-465
- 1050 Wendeln H, and Becker PH (1999) Effects of parental quality and effort on the reproduction of
1051 common terns. *J Anim Ecol* 68: 205-214
- 1052 Williams BK, Nichols JD, and Conroy JM (2002) *Analysis and Management of Animal*
1053 *Populations*. Academic Press, San Diego.
- 1054 Wilson AJ, and Festa-Bianchet M (2009) Maternal effects in Wild Ungulates. In: Maestripieri D,
1055 and Mateo JM (eds) *Maternal effects in mammals*. The University of Chicago Press,
1056 Chicago, U.S. A. pp83-103
- 1057 Wilson AJ, and Nussey DH (2009) What is individual quality? An evolutionary perspective.
1058 *Trends Ecol Evol* 25: 207-214
- 1059 Wilson AJ, Charmantier A, and Hadfield JD (2008) Evolutionary genetics of ageing in the wild:
1060 empirical patterns and future perspectives. *Funct Ecol* 22: 431-442
- 1061 Wilson AJ, Réale D, Clements MN, Morrissey MM, Postma E, Walling CA, Kruuk LEB, and
1062 Nussey DH (2010) An ecologist's guide to the animal model. *J Anim Ecol* 79: 13-26
- 1063 Yoerg SI (1997) Foraging behavior predicts age at independence in juvenile Eurasian dippers
1064 (*Cinclus cinclus*). *Behav Ecol* 9: 471-477