



An elementary proof of Catalan-Mihailescu theorem

Jamel Ghannouchi

► To cite this version:

| Jamel Ghannouchi. An elementary proof of Catalan-Mihailescu theorem. 2011. hal-00677731v12

HAL Id: hal-00677731

<https://hal.science/hal-00677731v12>

Preprint submitted on 7 Jun 2012 (v12), last revised 25 Oct 2014 (v35)

HAL is a multi-disciplinary open access archive for the deposit and dissemination of scientific research documents, whether they are published or not. The documents may come from teaching and research institutions in France or abroad, or from public or private research centers.

L'archive ouverte pluridisciplinaire **HAL**, est destinée au dépôt et à la diffusion de documents scientifiques de niveau recherche, publiés ou non, émanant des établissements d'enseignement et de recherche français ou étrangers, des laboratoires publics ou privés.

An elementary proof of Catalan-Mihailescu theorem

Jamel Ghanouchi

jamel.ghanouchi@topnet.tn

Abstract

(MSC=11D04) More than one century after its formulation by the Belgian mathematician Eugene Catalan, Preda Mihailescu has solved the open problem. But, is it all ? Mihailescu's solution utilizes computation on machines, we propose here not really a proof as it is entended classically, but a resolution of an equation like the resolution of the polynomial equations of third and fourth degrees. This solution is totally algebraic and does not utilize, of course, computers or any kind of calculation. Then, we generalize the proof to Pillai conjecture.

(Keywords : Diophantine equations ; Catalan equation ; Pillai conjecture ; Algebraic resolution)

Introduction

Catalan theorem has been proved in 2002 by Preda Mihailescu. In 2004, it became officially Catalan-Mihailescu theorem. This theorem stipulates that there are not consecutive pure powers. There do not exist integers stricly greater than 1, $X > 1$ and $Y > 1$, for which with exponents strictly greater than 1, $p > 1$ and $q > 1$,

$$Y^p = X^q + 1$$

but for $(X, Y, p, q) = (2, 3, 2, 3)$. We can verify that

$$3^2 = 2^3 + 1$$

Euler has proved that the equation $X^3 + 1 = Y^2$ has this only solution. We propose in this study a general solution. The particular cases already solved concern $p = 2$, solved by Ko Chao in 1965, and $q = 3$ which has been solved in 2002. The case $q = 2$ has been solved by Lebesgue in 1850. We solve here the equation for the general case. We generalize the proof to Pillai conjecture

$$Y^p = X^q + a$$

And prove that it has always a finite number of solutions for a fixed a .

The approach

Let

$$c = \frac{X^p - 1}{Y^{\frac{p}{2}}}, \quad c' = \frac{7 - X^p}{Y^{\frac{p}{2}}}$$

But

$$(c + c')Y^{\frac{p}{2}} = X^p - 1 + 7 - X^p = 6 \Rightarrow Y^{\frac{p}{2}} = \frac{6}{c + c'}$$

And

$$X^p = cY^{\frac{p}{2}} + 1 = \frac{6c}{c + c'} + 1 = \frac{7c + c'}{c + c'}$$

And

$$X^q = Y^p - 1 = \frac{36 - (c + c')^2}{(c + c')^2}$$

We have

$$(c + c')Y^{\frac{p}{2}} = 6 > 0$$

Thus $c + c' > 0$. Also

$$cY^{\frac{p}{2}} = X^p - 1 > 0$$

Thus $c > 0$. But $X^p \geq 4$, hence

$$cY^{\frac{p}{2}} = X^p - 1 \geq 7 - X^p = c'Y^{\frac{p}{2}}$$

hence $c \geq c'$

$$7 - X^p = 7 - \frac{7c + c'}{c + c'} = \frac{6c'}{c + c'}$$

If

$$c' > 0$$

Thus $X^p < 7$ and $X^p = 4$, it means that $c' < 0$ and

$$(c + c')Y^{\frac{p}{2}} = 6 > 0$$

$$(c + c')X^p = 7c + c' > 0$$

thus $c + c' > 0$ and

$$Y^{\frac{p}{2}} = \frac{6}{c + c'} \geq 3 \Rightarrow c + c' \leq 2$$

Lemma If a and b are positive numbers with $b > a$ then

$$ac + bc' < 0$$

Proof of the lemma If $ac + bc' > 0$ then

$$acY^{\frac{p}{2}} + bc'Y^{\frac{p}{2}} = a(X^p - 1) + b(7 - X^p) = ((a - b)X^p + 7b - a) > 0$$

Thus

$$7b - a > (b - a)X^p > 0$$

And X^p is determined, thus it is impossible and

$$ac + bc' < 0$$

main results What we must retain is

$$1) c' < 0$$

$$2) 0 < c + c' < 2$$

$$3) 0 < 7c + c'$$

And we will discuss two cases

$$I) c^2 < 1$$

$$II) c^2 \geq 1$$

case $c^2 < 1$ $c < 1$ means that $(c - 1)Y^{\frac{p}{2}} = d - 1 < 0$, we deduce

$$(c' + 1)Y^{\frac{p}{2}} = 7 - d > 0$$

Thus $c' > -1$. But

$$\begin{aligned} 2X^q - X^{2p} &= \frac{72 - 2(c + c')^2 - (7c + c')^2}{(c + c')^2} \\ &= \frac{72 - 51c^2 - 3c'^2 - 18cc'}{(c + c')^2} \\ &= \frac{51(1 - c^2) - 3c'(c + c') - 15cc' + 21}{(c + c')^2} > 0 \end{aligned}$$

Thus

$$2X^q > X^{2p} \quad (1)$$

And

$$\begin{aligned} c^2 X^q - X^{2p} &= \frac{36c^2 - c^2(c + c')^2 - (7c + c')^2}{(c + c')^2} \\ &= \frac{36c^2 - c^4 - c^2c'^2 - 2c^3c' - 49c^2 - c'^2 - 14cc'}{(c + c')^2} \\ &= \frac{-13c(c + c') - c'c(1 + (c' + 2c)c) - c^4 - c'^2}{(c + c')^2} \\ &= \frac{c(-13c - 14c' - 2c^2c' - cc'^2 - c^3) - c'^2}{(c + c')^2} \\ &= \frac{c(-13c - 13c' - c'c(c + c') - c^2(c' + c)) - c'(c + c')}{(c + c')^2} \\ &< \frac{c(-12c - 12c') - (c + c')^2 - c(c + c')^2}{(c + c')^2} < 0 \end{aligned}$$

Thus

$$c^2 X^q < X^{2p} \quad (2)$$

Also

$$\begin{aligned} 100c^2 X^q - 99X^{2p} &= \frac{3600c^2 - 100c^2(c + c')^2 - 99(7c + c')^2}{(c + c')^2} \\ &= \frac{(60c - \sqrt{99}(7c + c'))(60c + \sqrt{99}(7c + c')) - 100c^2(c + c')^2}{(c + c')^2} \end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned}
&= \frac{(-9.64c - 9.94c')(129.64c + 9.94c') - 100c^2(c + c')^2}{(c + c')^2} \\
&< \frac{-1249.73c^2 - 98.8c'^2 - 1384.24cc'}{(c + c')^2} \\
&= \frac{-67.26c'(c + 1.1c') - 1249.73c(c + c') - 24.81c'(c' + 2.44c)}{(c + c')^2} \\
&= \frac{c'(-127.91c - 98.8c') - 9.77c(127.91c + 98.8c') - 29.11cc'}{(c + c')^2} \\
&= \frac{-(127.91c + 98.8c')(9.77c + c') - 29.11cc'}{(c + c')^2} < 0
\end{aligned}$$

because

$$\begin{aligned}
127.91c + 98.8 &> -29.11c' > 0 \\
9.77c + c' &> c > 0
\end{aligned}$$

We deduce

$$\frac{c^2}{2}X^{2p} < c^2X^q < X^{2p} \quad (3)$$

And

$$c^2X^q < \frac{99}{100}X^{2p} \quad (4)$$

But

$$X^{2p-q-1} < 2X^{-1} \leq 1$$

Thus

$$2p \leq q + 1$$

But

$$0 > c^2 - 1 = X^{2p} - 2X^p - c^2X^q > X^{2p} - 2X^p - \frac{99}{100}X^{2p} > 0$$

It means that $c^2 = 1$ and

$$\begin{aligned}
X^p - X^{p-1} &= 2 \\
X^{p-1} - X^{p-2} &= \frac{2}{X}
\end{aligned}$$

This expression is an integer, hence $X = 2$ and

$$2^{p-1} = 1 + 2^{p-2}$$

In one side an even number, in the other an odd one, it is possible if $p = 2$, thus $q = 2p - 1 = 3$

Case $c \geq 1$ We must retain here that

$$1) c^2 > 1$$

$$2) c + c' < 2$$

$$3) c' < 0$$

We have

$$\begin{aligned} 2c^2 X^q - X^{2p} &= \frac{72c^2 - 2c^2(c + c')^2 - (7c + c')^2}{(c + c')^2} \\ &= \frac{72c^2 - 49c^2 - c'^2 - 14cc' - 2c^2(c^2 + c'^2 + 2cc')}{(c + c')^2} \\ &= \frac{c^2(23 - 2(c + c')^2) - c'(c + c') - 13cc'}{(c + c')^2} \\ &> \frac{15c^2 - c'(c + c') - 13cc'}{(c + c')^2} > 0 \end{aligned}$$

Or

$$2c^2 X^q > X^{2p} > 4X^p \Rightarrow c^2 X^q > 2X^p \quad (5)$$

And

$$\begin{aligned} c^2 X^q - X^{2p} &= \frac{36c^2 - c^2(c + c')^2 - (7c + c')^2}{(c + c')^2} \\ &= \frac{36c^2 - 50c^2 - 2c'^2 - 16cc' + (1 - c^2)(c + c')^2}{(c + c')^2} \\ &= \frac{-2(7c + c')(c + c') + (c + c')^2(1 - c^2)}{(c + c')^2} < 0 \end{aligned}$$

We deduce

$$\begin{aligned} \frac{1}{2} X^{2p} &< c^2 X^q < X^{2p} < c^2 X^{2p} \quad (6) \\ X^{2p-q} &> c^2 > 1 \end{aligned}$$

And

$$2p \geq q + 1$$

We have seen that $2c^2 X^{2p-1} \geq 2c^2 X^q > X^{2p}$, we deduce $2c^2 > X$, we will prove now that $X > c$ let

$$X^p - c^p = \frac{c(7 - c^p) + c'(1 - c^p)}{c + c'}$$

But from the lemma, as $c^p - 1 > c^p - 7 > 0$, we deduce

$$(c^p - 7)c + (c^p - 1)c' < 0 \Rightarrow (7 - c^p)c + (1 - c^p)c' > 0$$

It means that $X^p > c^p$ or $X > c$ But

$$2c^2 X^{q-2p} > 1 \Rightarrow X^{q+2-2p} > \frac{X^2}{2c^2} > \frac{1}{2}$$

Thus

$$0 \geq q + 1 - 2p \geq 0$$

Or $q + 1 = 2p$, we deduce

$$X = \frac{X^{2p}}{X^q} \leq 2$$

We deduce $(X, p) = (2, 2)$ or Catalan solution.

Generalization to Pillai equation

Pillai equation is $Y^p = X^q + a$. We will define Pillai numbers : we note them : b_a they depend of a and have the same proprieties than b for $a = 1$. Thus, we write $1_a + 7_a = 8_a$ and $7_a - 1_a = 6_a$: our goal is to follow the approach as we have done for Catalan equation. Of course, we have $1_a = a_1$ et $0_a = 0$. The equation becomes $Y^p = X^q + 1_a$. Let us pose for p, q, X, Y, a integers stricly greater to 1. Let

$$c = \frac{X^p - 1_a}{Y^{\frac{p}{2}}}, \quad c' = \frac{7_a - X^p}{Y^{\frac{p}{2}}}$$

Also

$$d = X^p - Y^{\frac{p}{2}}, \quad d' = X^p + Y^{\frac{p}{2}}$$

And

$$(c + c')Y^{\frac{p}{2}} = X^p - 1_a + 7_a - X^p = 6_a \Rightarrow Y^{\frac{p}{2}} = \frac{6_a}{c + c'}$$

So

$$X^p = cY^{\frac{p}{2}} + 1_a = \frac{6_ac}{c + c'} + 1_a = \frac{7_ac + 1_ac'}{c + c'}$$

And

$$X^q = Y^p - 1_a = \frac{36_a 1_a - 1_a(c + c')^2}{(c + c')^2}$$

Also

$$(c + c')Y^{\frac{p}{2}} = 6_a > 0$$

Thus $c + c' > 0$. And

$$cY^{\frac{p}{2}} = X^p - 1_a > 0$$

So $c > 0$. But $X^p \geq 4_a$, then

$$cY^{\frac{p}{2}} = X^p - 1_a \geq 7_a - X^p = c'Y^{\frac{p}{2}}$$

And $c \geq c'$

$$7_a - X^p = 7_a - \frac{7_ac + 1_ac'}{c + c'} = \frac{6_ac'}{c + c'}$$

If

$$c' > 0$$

Then $X^p < 7_a$ and we have a finite number of solutions, we have $c' < 0$, with

$$(c + c')Y^{\frac{p}{2}} = 6_a > 0$$

$$(c + c')X^p = 7_ac + 1_ac' > 0$$

with $c + c' > 0$. And

$$Y^{\frac{p}{2}} = \frac{6_a}{c + c'} \geq 3_a \Rightarrow c + c' \leq 2 < 2_a$$

Lemma If a and b are positive numbers with $b > a$ then

$$ac + bc' < 0$$

Proof of the lemma If $ac + bc' > 0$ then

$$acY^{\frac{p}{2}} + bc'Y^{\frac{p}{2}} = a(X^p - 1) + b(7 - X^p) = ((a - b)X^p + 7b - a) > 0$$

Thus

$$7b - a > (b - a)X^p > 0$$

And X^p is determined, thus it is impossible and

$$ac + bc' < 0$$

Main results We retain

$$1) c' < 0$$

$$2) 0 < c + c' < 2_a$$

$$3) 0 < 7_a c + 1_a c'$$

And we will discuss two cases

$$I) c^2 < 1_a$$

$$II) c^2 \geq 1_a$$

We have to not forget that $X^p - 1_a > 0$ and $7_a - X^p < 0$.

case $c^2 < 1_a$ Let

$$\begin{aligned} 2_a X^q - X^{2p} &= \frac{72_a 1_a 1_a - 2_a 1_a (c + c')^2 - (7_a c + 1_a c')^2}{(c + c')^2} \\ &= \frac{72_a 1_a 1_a - 1_a (49_a + 2_a) c^2 - 1_a (1_a + 2_a) c'^2 - 2_a (7_a + 1_a) c c'}{(c + c')^2} \\ &= \frac{70_a 1_a 1_a - 49_a 1_a c^2 + 2_a 1_a (1_a - c^2) - (2_a 1_a + 1_a 1_a) c' (c + c') - 13_a 1_a c c'}{(c + c')^2} > 0 \end{aligned}$$

Thus $2_a X^q - X^{2p} > 0$

$$2_a X^q > X^{2p} \quad (7)$$

And also

$$\begin{aligned} c^2 X^q - X^{2p} &= \frac{36_a 1_a c^2 - 1_a c^2 (c + c')^2 - (7_a c + 1_a c')^2}{(c + c')^2} \\ &= \frac{36_a 1_a c^2 - 1_a c^4 - 1_a c^2 c'^2 - 2_a c^3 c' - 49_a 1_a c^2 - 1_a 1_a c'^2 - 14_a 1_a c c'}{(c + c')^2} \\ &= \frac{-13_a 1_a c (c + c') - 1_a c' c (1_a + (c' + 2c)c) - 1_a c^4 - 1_a 1_a c'^2}{(c + c')^2} \\ &= \frac{c(-13_a 1_a c - 14_a 1_a c' - 2_a c^2 c' - 1_a c c'^2 - 1_a c^3) - 1_a 1_a c'^2}{(c + c')^2} \end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned}
&= \frac{c(-13_a 1_a c - 13_a 1_a c' - 1_a c' c(c + c') - 1_a c^2(c' + c)) - 1_a 1_a c'(c + c')}{(c + c')^2} \\
&< \frac{c(-12_a 1_a c - 12_a 1_a c') - 1_a 1_a (c + c')^2 - 1_a c(c + c')^2}{(c + c')^2} < 0
\end{aligned}$$

So

$$c^2 X^q < X^{2p} \quad (8)$$

Let us try

$$\begin{aligned}
100_a c^2 X^q - 99 X^{2p} &= \frac{3600_a 1_a c^2 - 100_a c^2(c + c')^2 - 99(7_a c + 1_a c')^2}{(c + c')^2} \\
&= \frac{(60_a c - \sqrt{99}(7_a c + 1_a c'))(60_a c + \sqrt{99}(7_a c + 1_a c') - 100_a c^2(c + c')^2}{(c + c')^2} \\
&= \frac{(-9.64_a c - 9.94_a c')(129.64_a c + 9.94_a c') - 100_a c^2(c + c')^2}{(c + c')^2} \\
&< \frac{-1249.73_a 1_a c^2 - 98.8_a 1_a c'^2 - 1384.24_a 1_a c c'}{(c + c')^2} \\
&= \frac{-67.26_a c'(1_a c + 1.1_a c') - 1249.73_a 1_a c(c + c') - 24.81_a c'(1_a c' + 2.44_a c)}{(c + c')^2} \\
&= \frac{1_a c'(-127.91_a c - 98.8_a c') - 9.77_a c(127.91_a c + 98.8_a c') - 29.11_a 1_a c c'}{(c + c')^2} \\
&= \frac{-(127.91_a c + 98.8_a c')(9.77_a c + 1_a c') - 29.11_a 1_a c c'}{(c + c')^2} < 0
\end{aligned}$$

Because

$$\begin{aligned}
127.91_a c + 98.8_a c' &> -29.11_a c' > 0 \\
9.77_a c + 1_a c' &> 1_a c > 0
\end{aligned}$$

Thus, we have

$$\frac{c^2}{2_a} X^{2p} < c^2 X^q < X^{2p} \quad (9)$$

And

$$c^2 X^q < \frac{99}{100_a} X^{2p} \quad (10)$$

Or

$$X^{2p-q-1} < 2_a X^{-1} \leq 1$$

And evidently

$$2p - q - 1 \leq 0$$

But

$$0 > 1_a(c^2 - 1_a) = X^{2p} - 2_a X^p - c^2 X^q > X^{2p} - 2_a X^p - \frac{99}{100_a} X^{2p} = \frac{100_a - 99}{100_a} X^p (X^p - \frac{200_a 1_a}{100_a - 99}) > 0$$

So

$$c^2 = 1_a$$

Because $0 \leq c^2 - 1_a \leq 0$ and then

$$X^p - 2_a = X^{q-p} \geq 2$$

$X^{p-1} - X^{q-p-1} = \frac{2_a}{X}$ is an integer and there is a finite number of solutions. We always have

$$X^{q+1} \leq X^{2p} \leq X^{q+1}$$

Or

$$0 \geq (c^2 - 1_a)Y^p = X^{2p} - 2_a X^p - 1_a X^q = X^{2p} - 2_a X^p - 1_a X^{2p-1} = X^p(X^{p-1}(X - 1_a) - 2_a) \geq 0$$

And $c^2 = 1_a$

$$X^p - X^{p-1} = 2_a$$

And there is a finite number of solutions !

Cas $c^2 \geq 1_a$ We will retain

- 1) $c^2 > 1_a$
- 2) $c + c' < 2_a$
- 3) $c' < 0$

As precendently :

$$\begin{aligned} 2c^2 X^q - X^{2p} &= \frac{72_a 1_a c^2 - 2_a c^2 (c + c')^2 - (7_a c + 1_a c')^2}{(c + c')^2} \\ &= \frac{72_a 1_a c^2 - 49_a 1_a c^2 - 1_a 1_a c'^2 - 14_a 1_a c c' - 2_a c^2 (c^2 + c'^2 + 2c c')}{(c + c')^2} \\ &= \frac{c^2 (23_a 1_a - 2_a (c + c')^2) - 1_a 1_a c' (c + c') - 13_a 1_a c c'}{(c + c')^2} \\ &> \frac{15_a 1_a c^2 - 1_a 1_a c' (c + c') - 13_a 1_a c c'}{(c + c')^2} > 0 \end{aligned}$$

And

$$2c^2 X^q > X^{2p} \quad (11)$$

And

$$2c^2 X^q > X^{2p} > 4X^p \Rightarrow c^2 X^q > 2X^p \quad (11')$$

Also

$$\begin{aligned} c^2 X^q - X^{2p} &= \frac{36_a 1_a c^2 - 1_a c^2 (c + c')^2 - (7_a c + 1_a c')^2}{(c + c')^2} \\ &< \frac{36_a 1_a c^2 - 50_a 1_a c^2 - 2_a 1_a c'^2 - 16_a 1_a c c' + (1_a 1_a - 1_a c^2)(c + c')^2}{(c + c')^2} \\ &= \frac{-21_a (7_a c + 1_a c')(c + c') + (c + c')^2 (1_a 1_a - 1_a c^2)}{(c + c')^2} < 0 \end{aligned}$$

Thus

$$\frac{1}{2} X^{2p} < c^2 X^q < X^{2p} < c^2 X^{2p} \quad (12)$$

Or

$$X^{2p-q} > c^2 > 1_a > 1$$

We have here

$$2p \geq q + 1$$

We have seen that $2c^2 X^{2p-1} \geq 2c^2 X^q > X^{2p}$, we deduce $2c^2 > X$, we will prove now that $X > c$ let

$$X^p - c^p = \frac{c(7_a - c^p) + c'(1_a - c^p)}{c + c'}$$

But from the lemma, as $c^p - 1_a > c^p - 7_a > 0$, we deduce

$$(c^p - 7_a)c + (c^p - 1_a)c' < 0 \Rightarrow (7_a - c^p)c + (1_a - c^p)c' > 0$$

It means that $X^p > c^p$ or $X > c$ But

$$2c^2 X^{q-2p} > 1 \Rightarrow X^{q+2-2p} > \frac{X^2}{2c^2} > \frac{1}{2}$$

Thus

$$0 \geq q + 1 - 2p \geq 0$$

Or $q + 1 = 2p$, we deduce

$$X = \frac{X^{2p}}{X^q} \leq 2_a$$

We deduce a finite number of solutions. In all cases, Pillai equation has a finite number of solutions, it is the formulation of the conjecture. Thus, we have proved it.

Conclusion

Catalan equation is solved, an original solution exists ! We have generalized the approach to Pillai equation and proved that it always has a finite number of solutions. It is the proof of Pillai conjecture. It seems that many problems of number theory can be solved like this.

Références

- [1] P. MIHAILESCU A class number free criterion for catalan's conjecture, *Journal of Number theory* , **99** (2003).