



**HAL**  
open science

## Comment on "Optical rogue waves in telecommunication data streams"

E. Lantz

► **To cite this version:**

E. Lantz. Comment on "Optical rogue waves in telecommunication data streams". *Physical Review A: Atomic, molecular, and optical physics [1990-2015]*, 2012, 84, pp.067801. 10.1103/PhysRevA.84.067801 . hal-00662967

**HAL Id: hal-00662967**

**<https://hal.science/hal-00662967>**

Submitted on 11 May 2021

**HAL** is a multi-disciplinary open access archive for the deposit and dissemination of scientific research documents, whether they are published or not. The documents may come from teaching and research institutions in France or abroad, or from public or private research centers.

L'archive ouverte pluridisciplinaire **HAL**, est destinée au dépôt et à la diffusion de documents scientifiques de niveau recherche, publiés ou non, émanant des établissements d'enseignement et de recherche français ou étrangers, des laboratoires publics ou privés.

**Comment on “Optical rogue waves in telecommunication data streams”**

Eric Lantz\*

*Université de Franche Comté, Institut FEMTO-ST UMR 6174 CNRS, Laboratoire d’Optique P.M. Duffieux, Route de Gray,  
F-25030 Besançon cedex, France*

(Received 17 June 2011; published 7 December 2011)

Despite its title and its general presentation, the paper by Vergeles and Turitsyn [[Phys. Rev. A \*\*83\*\*, 061801 \(2011\)](#)] proves that rogue waves never exist in purely linear telecommunication systems.DOI: [10.1103/PhysRevA.84.067801](#)

PACS number(s): 42.79.Sz, 05.10.Gg, 42.81.-i, 89.70.-a

A rare event in physics should nevertheless have a non negligible probability of occurrence when considering long durations. For technological issues like that in Ref. [1], an event that has a weak probability to appear in, say, one million years, simply does not exist at all. In optical linear systems, the common knowledge is that the probability of a giant fluctuation due to the constructive interference of a great number of random fields rapidly becomes vanishingly small because of the central limit theorem. (Eq. (3) of Ref. [1]).

Optical rogue waves are usually defined as rare giant events that nevertheless appear because of nonlinearities with a probability greater than the usual negative exponential given by the central limit theorem, ensuring their actual existence. In contrast, the probability density function of Eq. (5) of Ref. [1] is, except for very small powers, smaller than the usual negative exponential of the power [Eq. (3)]. This simple fact precludes the existence of rogue waves in their usual sense. Moreover, it is straightforward to calculate from Eq. (3) an upper bound for the probability of occurrence of a fluctuation of the power  $P$  versus the mean power  $\bar{P}$  as high or higher than that shown in Fig. 1(b) of Ref. [1]. The result is  $\exp(-P/\bar{P}) \approx 10^{-60}$ , while  $3 \times 10^{24}$  bits can be transmitted at 100 Gbit/s in one million of years.

To conclude this Comment, the “giant statistical fluctuation” of Fig. 1(b) does not correspond to any reality in the considered linear model and, more generally, Ref. [1] shows that the deviations of optical linear systems from the central limit theorem render giant fluctuations even rarer than in the approximation of this theorem. Hence, Ref. [1] does not in any way prove the existence of linear rogue waves.

---

[1] S. Vergeles and S. K. Turitsyn, [Phys. Rev. A \*\*83\*\*, 061801 \(2011\)](#).

---

\*elantz@univ-fcomte.fr