# Cardiovascular Risk Evaluation and Anti-retroviral Therapy Effects in an HIV cohort: implications for clinical management: The CREATE 1 study 

Michael Aboud, Ali Elgalib, Laura Pomeroy, George Panayiotakopoulos, Elias<br>Skopelitis, Alastair Duncan, Ranjababu Kulasegaram, Caroline Dimian, Fiona<br>Lampe, Anthony S Wierzbicki, et al.

## - To cite this version:

Michael Aboud, Ali Elgalib, Laura Pomeroy, George Panayiotakopoulos, Elias Skopelitis, et al.. Cardiovascular Risk Evaluation and Anti-retroviral Therapy Effects in an HIV cohort: implications for clinical management: The CREATE 1 study. International Journal of Clinical Practice, 2010, 64 (9), pp.1252. 10.1111/j.1742-1241.2010.02424.x . hal-00599540

HAL Id: hal-00599540
https://hal.science/hal-00599540
Submitted on 10 Jun 2011

HAL is a multi-disciplinary open access archive for the deposit and dissemination of scientific research documents, whether they are published or not. The documents may come from teaching and research institutions in France or abroad, or from public or private research centers.

L'archive ouverte pluridisciplinaire HAL, est destinée au dépôt et à la diffusion de documents scientifiques de niveau recherche, publiés ou non, émanant des établissements d'enseignement et de recherche français ou étrangers, des laboratoires publics ou privés.

## UICB THE INTERNATIONALJOURNAL OF

## CLINICAL PRACTICE

## Cardiovascular Risk Evaluation and Anti-retroviral Therapy

 Effects in an HIV cohort: implications for clinical management: The CREATE 1 study| Journal: | International Journal of Clinical Practice |
| ---: | :--- |
| Manuscript ID: | IJCP-02-10-0109.FT10.R1 |
| Manuscript Type: | Original Paper |
| Specialty area: |  |
|  |  |

# Cardiovascular Risk Evaluation and Anti-retroviral Therapy Effects in an HIV cohort: implications for clinical management: The CREATE 1 study 

| Michael Aboud | Registrar in HIV Medicine <br> Guy's \& St Thomas' Hospitals |
| :--- | :--- |
| Ali Elgalib | Registrar in HIV Medicine <br> Guy's \& St Thomas' Hospitals |
| Laura Pomeroy | Research nurse HIV Medicine <br> Guy's \& St Thomas' Hospitals |
| George Panayiotakopoulos | Registrar in HIV Medicine <br> Guy's \& St Thomas' Hospitals |
| Elias Skopelitis | Registrar in HIV Medicine |
| Ranjababu Kulasegaram | Guy's \& St Thomas' Hospitals <br> Consultant in HIV Medicine |
| Caroline Dimian | Guy's \& St Thomas' Hospitals |
| Fiona C Lampe | Consultant Sexual Health/HIV |

Address for correspondence
Dr Barry Peters
HIV Unit , Harrison Wing, St Thomas Hospital, Westminster Bridge Rd., London SE1 7EH UK
T +44-207-188-2625 F +44-207-188-2646 E-mail: Barry.Peters@kcl.ac.uk
Conflict of Interest: BSP has sat as a consultant on advisory boards for Abbott, GlaxoSmithKline, and Tibotec Pharmaceuticals. ASW has received grant support, lecture honoraria and travel grants from Abbott, AstraZeneca, Fournier-Solvay, Gilead, GlaxoSmithKline, Merck kGA, Merck-Sharp \& Dohme, Roche, Pfizer, Sanofi-Aventis and Takeda pharmaceuticals.


#### Abstract

- 247 words (max 250)


#### Abstract

Aims: To determine the cardiovascular disease (CVD) risk profile of a large UK HIV cohort and how highly active antiretroviral therapy (HAART) affects this.

Methods: A cross-sectional study within a large inner city Hospital and neighbouring district hospital. 1021 HIV positive outpatients representative of the complete cohort; 990 who had no previous CVD were included in CVD risk analysis. We recorded demographics, highly active antiretroviral therapy (HAART) history and CVD risk factors. CVD and coronary heart disease (CHD) risks were calculated using the Framingham (1991) algorithm adjusted for family history.


Results: The non-CVD cohort ( $\mathrm{n}=990$ ) was $74 \%$ male, $51 \%$ Caucasian and $73.1 \%$ were on HAART. Mean age was $41 \pm 9$ years, systolic blood pressure $120 \pm 14 \mathrm{mmHg}$, total cholesterol $4.70 \pm 1.05 \mathrm{mmol} / \mathrm{L}, \mathrm{HDL}-\mathrm{C} 1.32 \pm 0.48 \mathrm{mmol} / \mathrm{L}$ and $37 \%$ smoked. Median CVD risk was 4 ( 0 $56) \%$ in men and $1.4(0-37) \%$ in women; CHD risks were $3.5(0-36) \%$ and $0.6(0-16) \%$. CVD risk was $>20 \%$ in $6 \%$ of men and $1 \%$ of women and $>10 \%$ in $12 \%$ of men and $4 \%$ of women. CVD risk was higher in Caucasians than other ethnicities; the risk factor contributing most was raised cholesterol. For patients on their first HAART, increased CHD risk (26.2\% vs. $6.5 \%$; odds ratio $4.03, \mathrm{p}<0.001$ ) was strongly related to duration of therapy.

Conclusions: Modifiable risk factors, especially cholesterol, and also duration of HAART, were key determinants of CVD risk.

Discussion: Regular CHD and/or CVD risk assessment should be performed on patients with HIV, especially during HAART therapy. The effect of different HAART regimens on CHD risk should be considered when selecting therapy.

Clinical Trials.gov identifier: NCT0105092

## What is known about this topic?

There is a higher incidence of observed cardiovascular disease in HIV patients, and this is increased with HIV therapy. Much of the increase has been ascribed to smoking within patients with high risk lifestyle, and the contribution of therapy and its duration to increasing cholesterol is uncertain.

## What does this article add?

This paper demonstrates that cholesterol, rather than smoking, is the most important contributor to increased predicted CV/CHD risk in our HIV cohort. It also shows that duration of HAART is key, and hence has important implications for the screening and management of patients with HIV infection.

## Paper: 3270 words

## Introduction

Anti-retroviral therapy (HAART) has reduced traditional HIV-associated disease and death[1]. Cardiovascular disease (CVD) has emerged as a major cause of morbidity and mortality in HIV following initial reports of dyslipidaemia[2 34 4], probably as a result of the combination of the pro-inflammatory effects of HIV infection, an increased prevalence of traditional risk factors (RFs), and the effects of HAART[5 67 8].

Cardiovascular disease risk screening is an increasing priority in national health care strategies[9]. Risk is calculated using tools derived from epidemiological studies including the USA Framingham study [10], UK primary care databases (QRISK)[11] and European prospective cohort studies (SCORE)[12]. In all these calculators, CVD or CHD risk is calculated using age, gender, smoking, systolic blood pressure (SBP), and total cholesterol: high-density lipoprotein cholesterol (TC: HDL-C) ratio[13]. Ad hoc adjustments can be made to CVD risk factor profiles to add the effects of family history of premature CHD, ethnicity and obesity[13]. HIV cohorts in the UK, and most of the developed world, are an "aging
population", and hence there is an increasing need to focus on CVD. Traditional CVD RFs are increased in HIV populations [14 15], and seem to predict risk in a similar fashion to uninfected populations [16].

This study was designed to describe the CVD RF burden in a large HIV cohort and to apply these findings to recommendations for clinical practice.

## Methods

## Setting

CREATE (cardiovascular risk evaluation and antiretroviral therapy) is a cross-sectional study looking at estimated 10-year CVD and CHD risk, and the metabolic syndrome in HIV, and this study, CREATE 1, concentrates on the former aspects. Recruitment was from a large inner London teaching hospital with a large HIV cohort (exceeding 2500), and a mediumsized local district hospital with a more affluent demographic.

## Study population

Patients at both hospitals are from a diverse ethnic and socioeconomic group. The study recruited from June 2005 to September 2006.The protocol was approved by the St Thomas' Hospital Ethics Committee. In order to minimise selection bias, all HIV-infected outpatients were eligible providing they were regular attendees for their general HIV care and were not pregnant. Patients were not recruited from specialist clinics, such as the lipodystrophy or hepatitis co-infection clinics, to avoid unfair weighting of patients with metabolic issues. These patients were still open to study entry from their general HIV clinic attendance. The research staff identified clinics for inclusion, and all such patients were offered entry.

## Data Collection

A structured proforma was used to collect data on demographics, basic anthropometry, HIV and HAART history, current CD4 cell counts, HIV viral loads and details of coinfections.

Ethnicity was self reported and categorised as: Afro-Caribbean, black African, white (Caucasian), Asian, and other. Details of HAART were recorded, including the date of commencement, protease inhibitor use, and the current regimen.

Anthropometric, physiological and biochemical parameters required to define cardiovascular risk and the metabolic syndrome were collected. The use of anti-atheroma therapies, including anti-thrombotic, antihypertensive, lipid-lowering and hypoglycaemic drugs, was collected, and the use of recreational drugs recorded. Weight, height, waist circumference and blood pressure, were measured by trained experienced research nurses or doctors using standard criteria. Blood pressure was measured in the sitting position after 5 minutes rest with an Omron 320 automated system calibrated to British Hypertension Society standards. Blood lipids were measured fasting when possible, and assayed on a Roche Hitachi platform by standard techniques of CHOD-PAP for cholesterol and a non-ionic precipitation method for HDL-cholesterol. Data were entered directly onto the proforma during clinic attendance. Missing information on the database was checked with the source data, clinical notes, on scheduled review. The database was regularly cross-checked with the source data.

The estimated risk of CVD and CHD was calculated using the Framingham (1991)[10] equation recommended for UK use by both the Joint British Societies Guidelines (2005)[17] and the National Institute for Health and Clinical Excellence (NICE) guidelines (2008)[18]. No adjustment was made for ethnicity as the population was of diverse origin and no specific correction factors exist for West Africans. CHD risk relates to the development of coronary heart disease (MI, CHD death, angina, coronary insufficiency). CVD additionally includes stroke, congestive heart failure and peripheral vascular disease.

To assess CVD risk in a control population, data was compared with the QRESEARCH database[19], which is derived from a UK general practice population, a selfreferred CVD risk programme in the UK (HEART-UK/Unilever CVD risk assessment study)[20] and with the combined DAD cohort studies of cardiovascular risk in HIV[15 21] Table 1a-c. The DAD study (Data Collection on Adverse Events of Anti-HIV Drugs) is a collaboration of eleven prospective cohorts of HIV-infected individuals from across Europe, Australia, and the US, totalling over 30,000 participants.

## Statistical Analysis

Statistical analysis was performed with SPSS. This analysis included only patients free of pre-existing CHD diagnoses. Estimated 10-y CHD/CVD risk was summarised using medians and the proportion with values $>10 \%$ and $>20 \%$ per decade. Subgroups were compared using Chi-squared or Fishers exact test for categorical variables and Mann-Whitney tests for continuous variables. Logistic regression was used to assess the association of HAART use with $10-\mathrm{y}$ CHD risk $>10 \%$ and to investigate the extent to which this association was independent of traditional CHD risk factors. The association of duration of HAART use with 10-y CHD risk was examined in a subgroup of patients on first line HAART.

## Results

## Patient Characteristics

1021 patients were recruited, of which 990 were free of pre-existing CVD (table 1). For the purposes of data presentation and analysis (table $1 \mathrm{a} \& 1 \mathrm{~b}$ )the total numbers in CREATE1 were 990 and exclude patients with established CVD. For purposes of comparison with the DAD study cohorts, which included CVD, data from the complete cohort of 1021 was used (table 1c).

The majority, $74 \%$, were male, $50.8 \%$ were white, $6.9 \%$ Afro-Caribbean, $33.3 \%$ African (various), $1.9 \%$ Asian, and $6.9 \%$ from other ethnic groups. Men who have sex with men (MSM) comprised $43.9 \%$, and $41 \%$ were heterosexual. Intravenous drug abuse was reported by $1.65 \%$. The median HIV viral load was 50 copies/ml and CD4 count 406 cells $/ \mathrm{mm}^{3}$, and $73.1 \%$ were on HAART. CVD was present in $3 \%$ of both men and women, and diabetes in $3 \%$ and $2 \%$ respectively. The mean $( \pm \mathrm{SD})$ age was $41 \pm 9$ years $(48.6 \% \geq 40$ years). Current or recent smoking (within 5 years) was reported by $37 \%$ and was commoner in whites ( $51 \%$ vs. $23 \%$; $\mathrm{p}=0.02$ ) than black Africans. The systolic blood pressure (SBP) was $120 \pm 14 \mathrm{mmHg}$ and $11 \%$ had a SBP $>140 \mathrm{mmHg}$. The total cholesterol was $4.70 \pm 1.05 \mathrm{mmol} / \mathrm{L}$ and HDL-C was $1.32 \pm 0.48 \mathrm{mmol} / \mathrm{L}$. An elevated total cholesterol ( $>5 \mathrm{mmol} / \mathrm{L}$ ) was present in $35.6 \%$. $\mathrm{HDL}-\mathrm{C}<1 \mathrm{mmol} / \mathrm{L}$ in men or $<1.2 \mathrm{mmol} / \mathrm{L}$ in women was found in $33 \%$. An elevated TC: HDL ratio $>5$ was present in $18.7 \%$ and $>6$ in $7.6 \%$. Lipid-lowering drugs had been prescribed in $10.8 \%$.

The male population in CREATE 1 was younger ( 41 vs .52 yrs ), contained more smokers ( 45 vs. $13 \%$ ), had lower SBP ( $121 \mathrm{vs}$.140 mmHg ), slightly lower total cholesterol (4.7 vs. $5.1 \mathrm{mmol} / \mathrm{L}$ ) and less established CHD than those self-referring for CVD risk screening in the HEART-UK/Unilever study. Similarly women recruited to CREATE 1 were younger ( 39 vs .52 yrs ), had lower SBP ( 118 vs .134 mmHg ) and cholesterol ( 4.7 vs .5 .2 $\mathrm{mmol} / \mathrm{L}$ ) and less CHD ( 3 vs. $9 \%$ ) but more smoked (16 vs.13\%). HEART-UK/Unilever participants were markedly different in ethnic origin ( $92 \%$ were non-Caucasian) and were more centrally obese ( $64 \mathrm{vs} .40 \%$ ). The population was similar to that recruited to the DAD study cohorts (table 1c) except for marginally lower total cholesterol ( $4.7 \mathrm{vs} .5 .0 \mathrm{mmol} / \mathrm{l}$ ), higher HDL-C ( 1.23 vs. $1.1 \mathrm{mmol} / \mathrm{l}$ ) and BMI ( $24.7 \mathrm{vs} .23 \mathrm{~kg} / \mathrm{m}^{2}$ ) and a lower prevalence of current smoking ( 37 vs. $51 \%$ ).

## Cardiovascular and coronary Heart Disease Risk

The median CVD risk was $4(0-56) \% /$ decade in men and $1.4(0-37) \% /$ decade in women while CHD risks were $3.5(0-36) \% /$ decade and $0.6(0-16) \% /$ decade respectively. CVD risk was $>20 \%$ in $6 \%$ of men and $1 \%$ of women and $>10 \%$ in $12 \%$ of men and $4 \%$ of women while CHD risk exceeded $10 \%$ in $13 \%$ of men and $2 \%$ of women and was $>20 \%$ in $2 \%$ of men but no women. CVD risk was lower in all decade cohorts than the HEARTUK/Unilever study, although our patients were significantly younger and had a higher prevalence of smoking (table 1a \& 1b). There was suggestion of increased CHD risk among males in our cohort compared to general population seen by general practitioners [19] In this study for men aged $45-55$ years, CHD risk $>15 \%$ was present in $14.7 \%$ compared with $7.76 \%$ in the control group.. There was insufficient data to make meaningful comparisons for females.

Analyses were performed to investigate the associations of gender, ethnicity (Caucasians vs. non-Caucasians), risk group (MSM vs. heterosexuals) and use of HAART with CVD and CHD risk. The median CVD and CHD risks was $4.4 \%$ and $2 \%$ for men and $1.4 \%$ and $1 \%$ for women $(\mathrm{p}<0.001)$. The proportions with CVD risk $>10 \%$ were $21.8 \%$ vs. $3.8 \%$ ( $\mathrm{p}<0.001$ ) and for CHD risk $\geq 10 \% 16.4 \%$ vs. $0.4 \%$ ( $\mathrm{p}<0.001$ ) respectively. Statistically significant differences in CHD risk were also seen for those in older age groups, and groups stratified by total cholesterol above or below $5 \mathrm{mmol} / \mathrm{L}, \mathrm{SBP}$ above or below 140 mmHg and smokers vs. non-smokers. (data not shown)

Compared to non-Caucasians, Caucasians had greater CVD and CHD risks, and approximately a 3-fold increase in the prevalence of CHD risk $>10 \%$ or CVD risk $>20 \%$. These differences could partly be attributed to more males among our Causasians ( $96 \%$ vs. $53 \%$; $\mathrm{p}<0.001$ ) hence more MSM individuals ( $73 \%$ vs. $13 \%$; $\mathrm{p}<0.001$ ), higher viral load ( 2.63
vs. 2.33; $\mathrm{p}<0.001$ ), but also higher median CD4 count (432 vs. 381 ; $\mathrm{p}<0.001$ ), more smoking ( $50 \%$ vs. $22 \%$; p $<0.001$ ) and lower HDL-C (1.22 vs. $1.42 \mathrm{mmol} / \mathrm{L} ; \mathrm{p}<0.001$ ). No significant differences in CVD or CHD risk were observed in MSM compared to male heterosexuals, despite significant differences in age ( 40 vs. 42 years; p $<0.001$ ), smoking ( $50 \%$ vs. $37 \%$; $\mathrm{p}<0.001$ ) and prevalence of drug-treated hypertension ( $5 \%$ vs. $11 \%$; $\mathrm{p}=0.003$ ) and higher viral loads ( 2.66 vs. $2.33 ; \mathrm{p}<0.001$ ) and CD4 counts ( 434 vs. $381 ; \mathrm{p}<0.001$ ).

## HAART use

705 patients out of 973 were on HAART; 245 were on their first line regimen, of whom $44.1 \%$ had used HAART for $<1 \mathrm{yr}$, and about a third and a quarter used HAART for 13 yrs and $>3 \mathrm{yrs}$ respectively.

Patients on HAART had significantly raised median CVD risk (3.57\% vs. $2.34 \%$; $\mathrm{p}=0.01$ ) and CHD ( $0.64 \%$ vs. $0.38 \%$; $\mathrm{p}<0.001$ ) risk, associated with increased age ( 42 vs. 37 years, $\mathrm{p}<0.001$ ), higher total cholesterol ( $4.86 \mathrm{vs} .4 .24 \mathrm{mmol} / \mathrm{L} ; \mathrm{p}<0.001$ ) but also lower viral load (1.96 vs. 4.02; $\mathrm{p}<0.001$ ), and higher HDL-C ( 1.39 vs. $1.12 \mathrm{mmol} / \mathrm{L} ; \mathrm{p}<0.001$ ).

The duration of HAART was associated with CVD and CHD risk. For this analysis, only the 245 participants on first line therapy were included in order to avoid confounding from previous HAART use. The proportions with 10 year CVD and CHD risk $>20 \%$ for those on HAART $<1 \mathrm{yr}$ were $4.3 \%$ and $0.8 \%$ and for $\geq 3 \mathrm{yrs}$ exposure $11 \%$ and $4.8 \%$ respectively ( $p=0.01$ ). These differences were statistically significant for both Caucasians and non-Caucasians. A further analysis was performed to define variables within this group associated with increased CVD risk with duration of HAART. Age $\geq 40 \mathrm{yrs}$, total cholesterol $\geq 5 \mathrm{mmol} / \mathrm{L}$, and $\mathrm{SBP} \geq 140 \mathrm{mmHg}$ were all more common in the group who had been on HAART the longest. Conversely, there were fewer persons with low HDL-C in the $\geq 3$ year compared with $<1$ yr HAART groups and the TC/HDL ratio did not vary with length of time
on HAART (Table 3b). Smoking was not a factor that contributed to a higher CHD risk for those on HAART for longer periods (as a group), as there were similar proportions of smokers in each group regardless of the duration on HAART.

The contribution that each Framingham equation variable made to estimated CVD/CHD risk in patients on HAART was investigated. The unadjusted odds ratio for high CVD risk was $1.36(0.92,2.00)$ for HAART users vs. non- users. Adjusting for age and sex, the odds ratio fell to $1.13(0.72,1.80)$. Similarly the unadjusted odds ratio for high CHD risk was $1.59(0.99,2.57)$ for HAART users vs. non- users and after adjustment for age and sex, the odds ratio fell to $1.02(0.57,1.85)$. This excess risk was accounted for after adjustment for SBP, smoking and total cholesterol; the biggest fall in odds ratio was observed after correction for cholesterol alone ( 0.63 (0.34-1.20).

A similar analysis was performed for 245 patients on first-time HAART according to duration of HAART ( $<1$ year, 1-3 years, $\geq 3$ years) (figure 1 ). The unadjusted odds ratio for high CHD risk were 1.24 for 1-3 years and 5.13 for $\geq 3$ years groups, compared to the $<1$ year group (Figure 3). Again the greatest contribution to the excess risk in both the 1-3 years and $\geq$ 3 years groups was total cholesterol, as indicated by the comparatively large fall in odds ratio after adjustment for total cholesterol.

## Discussion

The increased frequency of observed CHD in HIV-infected versus uninfected patients has focused attention on appropriate strategies to prevent cardiovascular disease in this population. Observational cohort studies have shown an increase in observed CVD events with the use of HAART, particularly with protease inhibitors [15 21]. Some of the protease inhibitor effect can be attributed to drug-associated dyslipidaemia [21].

Among our UK-based cohort in CREATE1, levels of CVD and CHD risk appeared high compared to similar age groups in the general population, with a higher prevalence of smoking and hypercholesterolaemia. The average CVD and CHD risks in our cohort were $6.0 \%$ and $4.15 \%$ respectively. The CHD risk was much lower than the $7-7.4 \% \mathrm{CHD}$ risk seen in the Italian SIMONE cohort of HIV infected patients [22 23], where the prevalence of elevated CVD risk $>10 \%$ was $17 \%$ and CHD risk $>10 \%$ was $10 \%$. CVD risk $>20 \%$ was present in $4.9 \%$ and CHD risk $>20 \%$ in $1.6 \%$. Other cohort studies of HIV-infected patients have shown higher prevalence of CHD risk $>10 \%$ of $23 \%$ and $>20 \%$ in $8 \%$ [24] or $11 \%$ [14]. In the DAD study the same version of the Framingham risk scoring tool used in our study determined that the CHD risk was $2.4 \%$ [25]. Thus the population recruited to CREATE 1 is at intermediate risk for CVD compared to other HIV cohort studies. The CHD risk in the CREATE 1 cohort was elevated compared to a similar cohort of the general population from the QRESEARCH database and the proportions with elevated CVD risk were similar to sexmatched age cohorts from the self-selected general population recruited for the HEARTUK/Unilever Study[20].

We found in CREATE 1 that caucasians were much more likely to have a CVD or CHD risk $\geq 10 \%$ than non-Caucasians. Even amongst the non-Caucasians, the proportion with raised CVD or CHD risk increased with the duration of HAART (from $3.5 \%$ with $<1$ year use to $17.9 \%$ with $>3$ years use; $n=245$ first line users only). While many guidelines recommend adjustment of the Framingham risk for additional risk factors, this remains controversial. The Framingham risk calculator was derived from data on a mainly white working class population, and predicted the correct proportion at risk in patients with HIV in DAD cohort study [25]. Aside from Caucasians, the largest ethnic sub-group in CREATE 1 was African and diverse with respect to country of origin. Secondary adjustment for ethnicity is possible and tends to reduce CVD and CHD risk in African-derived populations compared to Asian or

Caucasian populations in the UK [26] but is limited and is mostly based on West Africans. The degree of adjustment required for other African populations has not been determined but CVD risk is elevated in urban or migrant populations[27 28]. In this study as CVD and CHD risks had already been adjusted for family history further adjustment was not performed[17]. In Afro-Caribbean general population the age-adjusted prevalence of CVD is 0.61 but there is no data on patients with HIV with this ethnic background in the UK.

In our study, the increased predicted CVD and CHD risk among Caucasians is at variance with a large prospective HIV cohort study of observed acute myocardial infarctions from the USA [29], where African-American race was a significant predictor of acute myocardial infarction, with a relative risk 1.43 compared to non-African-Americans. This may well reflect differences in underlying risk factors between the 2 cohorts, such as proportions of smokers, differences in BMI and dysglycaemia and effects of social deprivation. Similar discrepancies were found between our cohort and the same US cohort in respect of gender as among our female patients there were very few with even a moderately high predicted CVD or CHD risk. There was a marked increase in the relative rate of females with observed acute myocardial infarctions in the same US HIV cohort, with a relative risk of 2.98 , compared to the control population [29].

In this study smoking was less frequent than in the DAD cohort ( $37 \mathrm{vs} .52 \%$ ) and showed pronounced ethnic and gender differences. Smoking was most associated with CVD risk in males and was commoner in Caucasians. In females the prevalence of smoking was slightly increased compared to the general population. A large proportion of the cohort was heterosexual black African, where smoking was less prevalent than among Causasians (23\% vs. $51 \%$ ). Therefore, the relative contribution of smoking to CVD risk in this population is likely to be lower than in other studies.

The greatest population-attributable risk in the INTERHEART study was dyslipidaemia. Dyslipidaemia is frequent in HIV [25]. Dyslipidaemia related to the duration of HAART therapy contributed most to an increased predicted CVD and CHD risk amongst our cohort. The duration of first line HAART use was associated with a CHD risk $\geq 10 \%$, with a relative risk $>5$ for those on HAART for over 3 years compared to those who on HAART for under one year. This finding replicates those of the DAD study recruited from 1999-2003 [21] and shows that despite the availability of newer protease inhibitors that do not significantly affect lipid concentrations, most patients were still receiving HAART regimens that induced dyslipidaemia and increased CHD risk.

These findings provide a rationale for specific policies for the management of cardiovascular risk in people with HIV, using adaptations of standard guidelines from the Joint British Societies[17] or NICE [18]. This study demonstrates that management of CVD risk in HIV patients should consider length of exposure to HAART as well as ethnicity and gender. Risk calculators give only broad estimates of risk[30] and additional risk stratification may be required in intermediate ( $10-20 \%$ ) risk patients [31 32]. Patients at $10-20 \%$ risk should be prioritised for intensive lifestyle interventions. Modifiable risk factors should be actively managed, including the use of anti-hypertensives and lipid-lowering agents where lifestyle changes such as diet and exercise do not suffice. It is important for the individual and the patient cohort to reduce rates of smoking, and to attain optimum body weight[56]. If these intervention strategies are not successful in reducing CHD risk, then changing HAART regimens should be considered[33 34 35]. The observation that duration of first line HAART correlated strongly with CHD risk, has clinical implications for management. It is important that CHD is assessed before and after treatment, to ascertain the extent to which the HAART might be contributing to increased CHD risk. There are a number of antiretroviral agents that do not affect lipids to the extent of other current therapies. These include the newer generation
protease inhibitors, such as atazanavir[36], although this advantage is mitigated in part by the concomitant use of ritonavir as a pharmacological enhancer[37]. Other agents that have a favourable lipid profile include raltegravir, an integrase inhibitor[38], as well as some of the agents that have been available for many years, such as nevirapine[34 35].

## Acknowledgments

This study was supported by unrestricted educational grants of equal value from Abbott, Tibotec, Gilead and Roche Pharmaceuticals.

## List of Abbreviations

CREATE 1- Cardiovascular Risk Evaluation and Antiretroviral Therapy Effects (Study name).

BMI= body mass index.
$\mathrm{CHD}=$ coronary heart disease risk
$\mathrm{CVD}=$ cardiovascular disease risk.
$\mathrm{CVR}=$ cardiovascular risk.
HDL= high-density lipoprotein.
$\mathrm{IHD}=$ ischaemic heart disease.
MSM = men who have sex with men.
(s) $\mathrm{BP}=$ (systolic) blood pressure.
$\mathrm{TC}=$ total cholesterol.

Figure 1. Comparison of CHD risk with length of treatment with HAART before and after adjustment for CHD risk factors.


Contribution of CV risk factors to Odds Ratio (OR) for 10 year CHD risk $\mathbf{> 1 0 \%}$ by length of time on HAART.
N=243 first line HAART users only (Odds Ratio Y-axis). $1^{\text {st }}$ adjustment for age/sex; then sequentially for sBP, Smoking and Total Chol. The degree of OR drop reflects the contribution of that factor to risk in the first place. Biggest OR drop seen when TC corrected for.

Table 1a-c: Clinical characteristics of male and female patients attending a HIV service in the UK compared with a general cardiovascular risk screening group in the UK and the DAD cohort study.
1a - HIV positive males in CREATE 1 compared to a HEART UK population

|  | Cohort without CVD (male; $\mathrm{n}=737$ ) | $\begin{aligned} & \text { HEART-UK } \\ & \text { (male; } n=27,776 \text { ) } \end{aligned}$ |
| :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Age | $41.2 \pm 9.2$ | $51.5 \pm 16.2^{*}$ |
| Caucasian(\%) | 65 | Not available |
| Smoking (\%) | 45* | 13.4 |
| Systolic Blood Pressure ( mmHg ) | $121 \pm 14$ | $140 \pm 17^{*}$ |
| Hypertension (\%) | 12 | 13 |
| Total Cholesterol ( $\mathrm{mmol} / \mathrm{L}$ ) | $4.70 \pm 1.05$ | $5.10 \pm 1.00$ * |
| HDL-cholesterol ( $\mathrm{mmol} / \mathrm{L}$ ) | $1.25 \pm 0.44$ | $1.20 \pm 0.40$ |
| Diabetes (\%) | 2 | 4 |
| CHD (+) (\%) | NA | 11 |
| BMI ( $\mathrm{kg} / \mathrm{m}^{2}$ ) | $24.6 \pm 3.8$ | - |
| Waist > $\mathbf{1 0 2} \mathbf{~ c m ~ ( \% ) ~}$ | 24 | 25 |

1b - HIV positive females in CREATE 1 compared to a HEART UK population

|  | Cohort without CVD <br> (female; $\mathrm{n}=253$ ) | HEART-UK <br> (female; $\mathrm{n}=43,261)$ |
| :--- | :--- | :--- |
| Age | $38.8 \pm 8.8$ | $52.1 \pm 15.4^{\star}$ |
| Caucasian(\%) | 9 | Not available |
| Smoking (\%) | $16^{\star}$ | 12.7 |
| Systolic Blood Pressure <br> (mmHg) | $118 \pm 14$ | $134 \pm 19^{\star}$ |
| Hypertension (\%) | 9 | 13 |
| Total Cholesterol <br> (mmol/L) | $4.74 \pm 1.04$ | $5.20 \pm 1.00^{*}$ |
| HDL-cholesterol <br> (mmol/L) | $1.54 \pm 0.54$ | $1.50 \pm 0.40$ |
| Diabetes (\%) | 2 | 3 |
| IHD (+) (\%) | NA | $8.7^{\star}$ |
| BMI (kg/m ${ }^{2}$ ) | $27.8 \pm 6.1$ | - |
| Waist >88 cm (\%) | $64^{\star}$ | 40.1 |


| 1c - Complete cohort in <br> CREATE 1 compared <br> to subjects in the DAD <br> study | Complete CREATE 1 <br> cohort , including CVD <br> $(\mathrm{N}=1022)$ | DAD <br> $(\mathrm{N}=23,468)$ |
| :--- | :--- | :--- |
| Age | $40(35-46)$ |  |
| Caucasian(\%) | 51 | - |
| Male (\%) | 76 | 75 |
| MSM | 44 | 45 |
| Smoking (\%) | $37^{*}$ | 51 |
| Systolic Blood Pressure <br> (mmHg) | $120(110-130)$ | $120(110-130)$ |
| Hypertension (\%) | $12^{*}$ | 8.5 |
| Total Cholesterol <br> (mmol/L) | $4.7(3.9-5.3)$ | $5.0(4.2-6.0)$ |
| HDL-cholesterol <br> (mmol/L) | $1.23(1.00-1.53)$ | $1.1(0.9-1.4)$ |
| Diabetes (\%) | 3 | 2.5 |
| IHD (+) (\%) | 3 | 1.4 |
| CD4 count (mm $\left.{ }^{3} / \mathrm{L}\right)$ | $406(289-562)$ | $418(255-612)$ |
| Viral Load (log) | $<1.70(<1.70-3.54)$ | $<2.7(<2.7-6.9)$ |
| BMI (kg/m ${ }^{2}$ ) | $24.7(22.3-27.7)$ | $23(21-25)$ |
| Waist > 102 cm (\%) | 24 | - |
| Family history early <br> CHD (\%) | 13 | 11.7 |

Table 2. Association of factors with current HAART use

| $\mathrm{n} / \mathrm{N}(\%)$ | Using <br> HAART | Not using <br> HAART | p value |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |
|  | $\mathrm{N}=705$ | $\mathrm{~N}=258$ |  |
| Male | $509 / 705$ <br> $(72.2)$ | (Chi-squared/Fishers Exact <br> test $)$ |  |
| Age $>40$ yrs | $388 / 705$ <br> $(75.0)$ | $83 / 258(32.2)$ | $\mathrm{p}<0.001$ |
| Caucasian | $330 / 690$ <br> $(47.8)$ | $149 / 253$ <br> $(58.9)$ | $\mathrm{p}=0.003$ |
| MSM | $279 / 705$ <br> $(39.6)$ | $144 / 258$ <br> $(55.8)$ | $\mathrm{p}<0.001$ |
| Chol $>5$ mmol/l | $296 / 705$ <br> $(42.0)$ | $47 / 258(18.2)$ | $\mathrm{p}<0.001$ |
| Lipid lowering drug | $88 / 705(12.5)$ | $6 / 258(2.3)$ | $\mathrm{p}<0.001$ |
| use | $134 / 705$ <br> $(19.0)$ | $95 / 258(36.8)$ | $\mathrm{p}<0.001$ |
| HDL <1 mmol/l | $192 / 705$ <br> $(27.2)$ | $88 / 258(34.1)$ | $\mathrm{p}=0.037$ |
| TC/HDL ratio $>4.5$ | $29 / 258(11.2)$ | $\mathrm{p}=0.89$ |  |
| Sys BP $>140 \mathrm{mmHg}$ | $77 / 705(10.9)$ | $107 / 258$ <br> $(41.5)$ | $\mathrm{p}=0.087$ |
| Smoker | $250 / 705$ <br> $(35.5)$ |  |  |

Table 3 a \& b: Mean lipid values according to HAART use
a) Mean Total cholesterol, HDL cholesterol and Total/HDL ratio by current HAART use

| HAART now |  | Total <br> Cholesterol | HDL- <br> Cholesterol | TC: HDL <br> ratio |
| :--- | :--- | ---: | ---: | ---: |
| No | Mean | 4.28 | 1.14 | 4.05 |
|  | N | 258 | 258 | 258 |
|  | Std. Deviation | 0.89 | 0.34 | 1.32 |
|  | Mean | 4.88 | 1.40 | 3.84 |
|  | N | 705 | 705 | 705 |
|  | Std. Deviation | 1.06 | 0.51 | 1.34 |
|  | Mean | 4.72 | 1.33 | 3.90 |
|  | N | 963 | 963 | 963 |
|  | Std. Deviation | 1.05 | 0.49 | 1.34 |

b) Mean Total cholesterol, HDL cholesterol and Total/HDL ratio by years on first line

| Yrs ${ }^{\text {st }}$ Line |  | Total Cholesterol | HDLcholesterol | $\begin{aligned} & \text { TC: } \mathrm{HDL} \\ & \text { ratio } \end{aligned}$ |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| <1 | Mean | 4.50 | 1.23 | 3.98 |
|  | N | 108 | 108 | 108 |
|  | Std. Deviation | 0.97 | 0.42 | 1.27 |
| 1-3 | Mean | 4.81 | 1.41 | 3.75 |
|  | N | 76 | 76 | 76 |
|  | Std. Deviation | 0.96 | 0.50 | 1.33 |
| >=3 | Mean | 5.31 | 1.49 | 3.91 |
|  | N | 61 | 61 | 61 |
|  | Std. Deviation | 0.86 | 0.49 | 1.39 |
| Total | Mean | 4.80 | 1.35 | 3.89 |
|  | N | 245 | 245 | 245 |
|  | Std. Deviation | 0.99 | 0.48 | 1.32 |

## Contributions of authors:

BSP is senior author and conceived, designed and managed the clinical trial and wrote the manuscript. MA, ES, LP, GP, CD, RK, AD \& A E helped with study design and recruitment and manuscript writing. FL and AW helped with study design, manuscript writing and statistical analysis. All authors have seen all the key drafts, including final submission.

## Reference List

1 Bozzette SA, Ake CF, Tam HK, et al. Cardiovascular and cerebrovascular events in patients treated for human immunodeficiency virus infection. N Engl J Med 2003 Feb 20;348(8):702-10.

2 Braitstein P, Yip B, Heath KV, et al. Interventional cardiovascular procedures among HIV-infected individuals on antiretroviral therapy 1995-2000. AIDS 2003 Sep 26;17(14):2071-5.

3 Dube MP, Sprecher D, Henry WK, et al. Preliminary guidelines for the evaluation and management of dyslipidemia in adults infected with human immunodeficiency virus and receiving antiretroviral therapy: Recommendations of the Adult AIDS Clinical Trial Group Cardiovascular Disease Focus Group. Clin Infect Dis 2000 Nov;31(5):1216-24.

4 Currier JS. Cardiovascular risk associated with HIV therapy. J Acquir Immune Defic Syndr 2002 Sep 1;31 Suppl 1:S16-S23.

5 Kulasegaram R, Peters BS, Wierzbicki AS. Dyslipidaemia and cardiovascular risk in HIV infection. Curr Med Res Opin 2005 Nov;21(11):1717-25.

6 Aboud M, Elgalib A, Kulasegaram R, et al. Insulin resistance and HIV infection: a review. Int J Clin Pract 2007 Mar;61(3):463-72.

7 Wierzbicki AS, Purdon SD, Hardman TC, et al. HIV lipodystrophy and its metabolic consequences: implications for clinical practice. Curr Med Res Opin 2008 Mar;24(3):609-24.

8 Currier JS, Lundgren JD, Carr A, et al. Epidemiological evidence for cardiovascular disease in HIV-infected patients and relationship to highly active antiretroviral therapy. Circulation 2008 Jul 8;118(2):e29-e35.

9 Vascular Programme. Putting prevention first - vascular checks: risk assessment and management. London, UK: Department of Health; 2008 Apr 1. Report No.: 287093.

10 Anderson KM, Odell PM, Wilson PW, et al. Cardiovascular disease risk profiles. Am Heart J 1991 Jan;121(1 Pt 2):293-8.

11 Hippisley-Cox J, Coupland C, Vinogradova Y, et al. Predicting cardiovascular risk in England and Wales: prospective derivation and validation of QRISK2. BMJ 2008 Jun 28;336(7659):1475-82.

12 Conroy RM, Pyorala K, Fitzgerald AP, et al. Estimation of ten-year risk of fatal cardiovascular disease in Europe: the SCORE project. Eur Heart J 2003 Jun;24(11):987-1003.

13 Wierzbicki AS, Reynolds TM. Vascular risk screening: possible or too much, too soon? Int J Clin Pract 2009 Jul;63(7):989-96.

14 Bergersen BM, Sandvik L, Bruun JN, et al. Elevated Framingham risk score in HIVpositive patients on highly active antiretroviral therapy: results from a Norwegian study of 721 subjects. Eur J Clin Microbiol Infect Dis 2004 Aug;23(8):625-30.

15 Friis-Moller N, Weber R, Reiss P, et al. Cardiovascular disease risk factors in HIV patients--association with antiretroviral therapy. Results from the DAD study. AIDS 2003 May 23;17(8):1179-93.

16 Law MG, Friis-Moller N, El-Sadr WM, et al. The use of the Framingham equation to predict myocardial infarctions in HIV-infected patients: comparison with observed events in the D:A:D Study. HIV Med 2006 May;7(4):218-30.

17 British Cardiac Society, British Hypertension Society, Diabetes UK, et al. JBS 2: the Joint British Societies' guidelines for prevention of cardiovascular disease in clinical practice. Heart 2005;91 (suppl V):v1-v52.

18 National Institute for Health and Clinical Excellence. Lipid modification. London, UK: National Institute for Health and Clinical Excellence; 2008 Jun 17. Report No.: CG67.

19 University of Nottingham, EMIS national user group. QResearch database. QResearch Group 2009 [cited 2009 Jul 23];Available from: URL: $\underline{\text { http://www.qresearch.org }}$

20 Neil HA, Perera R, Armitage JM, et al. Estimated 10-year cardiovascular risk in a British population: results of a national screening project. Int J Clin Pract 2008 Sep;62(9):1322-31.

21 Friis-Moller N, Sabin CA, Weber R, et al. Combination antiretroviral therapy and the risk of myocardial infarction. $N$ Engl J Med 2003 Nov 20;349(21):1993-2003.

22 De Socio GV, Martinelli L, Morosi S, et al. Is estimated cardiovascular risk higher in HIV-infected patients than in the general population? Scand J Infect Dis 2007;39(9):805-12.

23 De Socio GV, Parruti G, Quirino T, et al. Identifying HIV patients with an unfavorable cardiovascular risk profile in the clinical practice: results from the SIMONE study. $J$ Infect 2008 Jul;57(1):33-40.

24 Knobel H, Jerico C, Montero M, et al. Global cardiovascular risk in patients with HIV infection: concordance and differences in estimates according to three risk equations (Framingham, SCORE, and PROCAM). AIDS Patient Care STDS 2007 Jul;21(7):452-7.

25 Law M, Friis-Moller N, Weber R, et al. Modelling the 3-year risk of myocardial infarction among participants in the Data Collection on Adverse Events of Anti-HIV Drugs (DAD) study. HIV Med 2003 Jan;4(1):1-10.

26 Brindle P, May M, Gill P, et al. Primary prevention of cardiovascular disease: a webbased risk score for seven British black and minority ethnic groups. Heart 2006 Nov;92(11):1595-602.

27 Steyn K, Levitt NS, Hoffman M, et al. The global cardiovascular diseases risk pattern in a peri-urban working-class community in South Africa. The Mamre study. Ethn Dis 2004;14(2):233-42.

28 Cappuccio FP, Oakeshott P, Strazzullo P, et al. Application of Framingham risk estimates to ethnic minorities in United Kingdom and implications for primary
prevention of heart disease in general practice: cross sectional population based study. BMJ 2002 Nov 30;325(7375):1271.

29 Triant VA, Lee H, Hadigan C, et al. Increased acute myocardial infarction rates and cardiovascular risk factors among patients with human immunodeficiency virus disease. J Clin Endocrinol Metab 2007 Jul;92(7):2506-12.

30 Reynolds TM, Twomey P, Wierzbicki AS. Accuracy of cardiovascular risk estimation in patients without diabetes. J Cardiovasc Risk 2002;9:183-90.

31 Hsue PY, Lo JC, Franklin A, et al. Progression of atherosclerosis as assessed by carotid intima-media thickness in patients with HIV infection. Circulation 2004 Apr 6;109(13):1603-8.

32 de Saint ML, Vandhuick O, Guillo P, et al. Premature atherosclerosis in HIV positive patients and cumulated time of exposure to antiretroviral therapy (SHIVA study). Atherosclerosis 2006 Apr; 185(2):361-7.

33 Currier JS, Lundgren JD. Guidelines for managing cardiovascular risk: an evolving area. Curr Opin HIV AIDS 2008 May;3(3):205-6.

34 Carr A, Hudson J, Chuah J, et al. HIV protease inhibitor substitution in patients with lipodystrophy: a randomized, controlled, open-label, multicentre study. AIDS 2001 Sep 28;15(14):1811-22.

35 Barragan P, Fisac C, Podzamczer D. Switching strategies to improve lipid profile and morphologic changes. AIDS Rev 2006 Oct;8(4):191-203.

36 Colafigli M, Di GS, Bracciale L, et al. Cardiovascular risk score change in HIV-1infected patients switched to an atazanavir-based combination antiretroviral regimen. HIV Med 2008 Mar;9(3):172-9.

37 Bentue-Ferrer D, Arvieux C, Tribut O, et al. Clinical pharmacology, efficacy and safety of atazanavir: a review. Expert Opin Drug Metab Toxicol 2009 Nov;5(11):1455-68.

38 Markowitz M, Nguyen BY, Gotuzzo E, et al. Rapid and durable antiretroviral effect of the HIV-1 Integrase inhibitor raltegravir as part of combination therapy in treatmentnaive patients with HIV-1 infection: results of a 48 -week controlled study. J Acquir Immune Defic Syndr 2007 Oct 1;46(2):125-33.

