

# NMR relaxometry as a potential non-invasive routine sensor for characterization of phenotype in Crassostrea gigas

A. Davenel, Stéphane Pouvreau, M. Cambert, M. Suquet, F. Mariette

# ▶ To cite this version:

A. Davenel, Stéphane Pouvreau, M. Cambert, M. Suquet, F. Mariette. NMR relaxometry as a potential non-invasive routine sensor for characterization of phenotype in Crassostrea gigas. Aquaculture, 2009, 291 (1-2, 3), p. 74 - p. 77. hal-00455517

# HAL Id: hal-00455517 https://hal.science/hal-00455517v1

Submitted on 10 Feb 2010  $\,$ 

**HAL** is a multi-disciplinary open access archive for the deposit and dissemination of scientific research documents, whether they are published or not. The documents may come from teaching and research institutions in France or abroad, or from public or private research centers. L'archive ouverte pluridisciplinaire **HAL**, est destinée au dépôt et à la diffusion de documents scientifiques de niveau recherche, publiés ou non, émanant des établissements d'enseignement et de recherche français ou étrangers, des laboratoires publics ou privés.

1	NMR relaxometry as a potential non-invasive routine sensor for
2	characterization of phenotype in Crassostrea gigas
3	
4	Armel Davenel <sup>a,c</sup> *, Stéphane Pouvreau <sup>b</sup> , Mireille Cambert <sup>a,c</sup> , Marc Suquet <sup>b</sup> ,
5	François Mariette <sup>a,c</sup>
6	<sup>a</sup> Cemagref, UR TERE, 17 avenue de Cucillé – CS 64427, F-35044 Rennes, France.
7	<sup>b</sup> Ifremer, UMR100, LPI, Station Expérimentale d'Argenton, 29840 Argenton en Landunvez, France.
8	<sup>c</sup> Université Européenne de Bretagne, France.
9	
10	* Corresponding author. Tel.: 33 2 2348 2160; Fax: 33 2 2348 2115; Email: armel.davenel@cemagref.fr

11

## 12 Abstract

13 MR imaging is the most appropriate non-invasive technique for quantifying the growth of 14 somatic and gonad tissues and to determine sex in the Pacific oyster, Crassostrea gigas. However, this technique is too costly for field studies where oysters are used as bioindicators of 15 16 environmental quality or to be applied routinely in hatcheries. We have tested the ability of low 17 Nuclear Magnetic Resonance relaxometry, a much less expensive technique, to obtain phenotype 18 parameters that can be used to monitor the physiological state of oysters. NMR measurements 19 were carried out at three different periods using a low field spectrometer equipped with a 50 mm 20 diameter probe to investigate 60 oysters in their first year of maturity, which were then dissected 21 to measure internal shell cavity volume and dry flesh weight and to determine sex and gonad 22 development. The NMR results showed that it was possible to determine both internal shell 23 cavity volume and dry flesh weight in less than one minute with very high determination  $R^2$ 24 coefficients (0.95 and 0.94, respectively). The results showed also that it was possible to identify sex and gonad development, with success rates of 93% and 83%, respectively. For oysters with 25 26 dry weight above 0.7g, the success rate in identifying sex was 100%. Further studies are required

27 to design an NMR probe that is appropriate for larger oysters and to improve sex discrimination

and prediction of gonad development with larger study groups.

29

- 30
- 31 Keywords: Phenotype characterization, Crassostrea gigas, NMR, growth, Sex identification
- 32

#### 33 1. Introduction

34 With an annual production of above 117,500 metric tons in 2006, production of the Pacific 35 oyster *Crassostrea gigas* is economically important in French aquaculture. However, the ecology 36 and physiology of this bivalve are not fully understood, and consequently monitoring of its growth and reproduction, both in the field and in hatcheries, is still based on empirical factors. 37 38 Investigation of soft tissues in marine mollusks, especially in marine bivalves, classically relies 39 on destructive methods, since a hermetic shell protects the animal. For example, anatomical 40 structures are generally studied after opening and dissection by means of histological sections, 41 with a resolution of 4-5 µm (Chavez-Villalba et al., 2002; Didri et al., 2007). The evolution of 42 gametogenesis can be quantitatively assessed with the help of image analysis (Chavez-Villalba et 43 al., 2003; Fabioux et al., 2005), and sex may be determined after anesthesia using magnesium 44 chloride and tissue sampling using needles (Namba et al., 1995). However, analysis of 45 physiological and biochemical changes requiring large volume tissue samples necessarily 46 involves the sacrifice of numerous specimens and the preparation and analysis of several 47 samples. These standard techniques provide valuable information on marine mollusk biology but 48 have two main disadvantages which are limitations for many studies: these methods are very 49 time consuming and they are necessarily destructive. Non-invasive and quantitative procedures 50 have therefore been developed, and after preliminary trials (Pouvreau et al., 2006) Nuclear 51 Magnetic Resonance (NMR) imaging (MRI) has proved promising.

Non-invasive characterization of gonad maturation and determination of the sex of Pacific oysters by Magnetic Resonance Imaging (MRI) has already been successfully tested using longitudinal relaxation T1-weighted MRI sequences (Davenel et al., 2006). MRI is the most appropriate technique for quantification of the growth of somatic and gonad tissues and to determine sex. However, this technique is too costly for field studies and particularly for routine use in hatcheries. Preliminary results (Davenel et al., 2006) of the characterization of various

oyster tissue samples by NMR relaxometry, a much less expensive technique, showed that the 58 T1 relaxation times of gonad and muscle were shorter than those of the heart, other viscera and 59 60 gills which are bathed in seawater, itself characterized by very high T1 and T2 relaxation time 61 values (more than 1600ms). These experiments ascertained that the NMR technique was able to differentiate the ovaries (T1 of about  $207\pm 21$  ms) from the testes (T1 of about  $456\pm 50$  ms) and 62 63 muscles (T1 of about  $461\pm 13$  ms). However, the NMR technique did not make it possible to 64 differentiate the male gonad and muscle on the basis of the T1 value alone. We report here the 65 ability of NMR to obtain phenotype parameters that can be used to monitor the physiological state of entire oysters in their shells by multivariate data analysis techniques on NMR transverse 66 67 T2 relaxation data weighted by longitudinal T1 relaxation using different relaxation delays.

68

#### 69 2. Materials and methods

## 70 2.1 Origin of animals and preparation

71 NMR measurements were carried out at three different periods (May 7, June 4 and June 29 2007) on 31 diploid (2N) and 25 triploid (3N) Crassostrea gigas oysters in their first year of maturity 72 to limit their size to the 52mm diameter of the NMR probe. They were bred by the IFREMER 73 74 Shellfish Laboratory located in Argenton near Brest (Brittany, France) and brought to Cemagref 75 in Rennes (Brittany, France) for NMR investigations without any specific anesthetization 76 procedure (distance 250 km). Before NMR measurements, animals were soaked in sea water to 77 expel any air bubbles. Sea water was kept at room temperature with the addition of 78 phytoplankton to facilitate the opening of oysters.

After NMR measurements, each oyster was measured and weighed using a standard method. First, individual total mass (*i.e.* shell plus tissue), was weighed to the nearest 0.1g on an electronic Sartorius balance (TW). Oysters were then opened and the flesh was drained for 15 min on absorbent paper and weighed using an electronic Sartorius balance to the nearest 0.001g to determine fresh flesh weight (FW). The difference between total weight (TW) and flesh weight (FW) provides an estimate of the internal shell cavity (ISC) expressed as mass unit (g). Gonad development (GD) was visually estimated at four qualitative stages from stage 0 (no visible gonad tissues) to stage 3 (well developed gonad tissues). A biopsy was then taken from each gonad and analyzed under a light microscope to determine sex. The presence of spermatozoa (2-3  $\mu$ m) or oocytes (30-50  $\mu$ m) in the sample indicated if oysters were male (M) or female (F), respectively. Triploid oysters that were asexual were annotated 3N. Finally dry flesh weight (DW) was measured after a 72-hour freeze-drying cycle.

91 2.2 NMR measurements

92 NMR measurements were performed at Cemagref (Rennes, Brittany, France) with an OXFORD 93 MQA 6005 spectrometer operating at 0.12T (5MHz) equipped with a 52mm vertical diameter 94 probe which allowed investigation of oysters in their first year of maturity (< 45 g total weight). 95 NMR data comprised the intensities of echoes originating from an NMR pulse sequence that 96 acquired two Carr-Purcell-Meiboom-Gill (CPMG) spin echo trains with different relaxation 97 delay (RD) times between each signal accumulation reflecting combined T1 and T2 relaxation 98 times (Table 1). The 15000ms RD time was chosen to obtain the full T2 relaxation signal of sea 99 water in the internal shell cavity without any T1 weighting. The 400ms RD time corresponded to 100 the T1-weighting parameter used in previous MRI experimentations (Davenel et al., 2006) to 101 obtain the best contrast between testes and ovaries. Low-field NMR measures the spin-spin (T2) 102 and spin-lattice (T1) relaxation of hydrogen nuclei (protons) in mobile or less mobile molecules.

#### 103 2.3 Statistical analysis

Ideally, after data treatment based on Levenberg-Marquardt or maximum entropy decomposition, low field NMR measurements lead to a distribution of spin-spin relaxation times with peaks corresponding to resonance states of hydrogen nuclei that may be related to specific classes of molecules in the sample, each class characterized by its state (liquid/solid), its diffusion rate or its type of bonding or interaction with other molecules. However, if the rate of chemical exchange of protons between different classes is faster than the time scale of the NMR experiment, two or more classes may be indistinguishable from each other and the exact number 111 and types of classes cannot be measured. We therefore chose to use other approaches based on 112 chemometric techniques to extract information from the NMR CPMG relaxation curves.

113 Determination of quantitative phenotype characteristics (ISC, FW and DW).

114 Because the first echo intensity of the non-T1-Weighed CPMG sequence with long RD 115 (15000ms) is proportional to the total proton density of the sample, we tested the simple linear 116 relationship between ISC and the intensity of this variable, and also the intensity of the first echo 117 of the T1-Weighed CPMG sequence with shorter RD value (400ms). Protons in the flesh were 118 water protons interacting with macromolecules or were constituents of lipids and their T2 119 relaxation parameters were shorter than sea water protons. Consequently we tested the linear 120 relationship between flesh weight (FW) or dry weight (DW) and a combination of the intensity 121 of the first echo and the intensity of a longer echo time, strongly weighted by the transverse 122 relaxation of the sea water protons.

123 The traditional univariate linear and multiple regression methods are of limited value to handle 124 the large amount of co-linear data points acquired by CPMG sequences. Multivariate data 125 analysis (chemometric) techniques include algorithms that can handle large co-linear data 126 structures. In this context, the main advantage of chemometric tools is that they are able to deal 127 with spectral or relaxation information, such as NIR and NMR (multivariate co-linear data) by 128 reducing data to a few latent factors (LF). Correlations between quantitative phenotype and 129 NMR data were evaluated using the partial least squares (PLS) predictive regression method on 130 relaxation data originating from the CPMG sequence for each RD value (CPMG-400, CPMG-

131 15000) separately and in combination with NMR data (CPMG-400-15000).

132 Determination of qualitative phenotype characteristics (SEX, GD).

First non-supervised principal component analysis (PCA) was performed to reduce the dimensions of the original CPMG data matrices retaining the maximum amount of variability. This provided a new set of variables (principal components, PCs) which facilitated the discovery of patterns hidden in the dataset. A stepwise linear discriminant analysis (LDA), a supervised method used for classification purposes, was then performed on PC variables. LDA renders a number of orthogonal linear discriminant functions equal to the number of classes minus one. This method maximizes variance between categories and minimizes variance within classes. Three sex classes were defined: male (M), female (F) and triploid or asexual oysters (3N), and the four qualitative stages described above were used for classification according to gonad development of diploid oysters.

Stepwise PLS and LDA procedures were combined with the leave-one-out cross-validation procedure to seek subsets of synthetic LF or PC variables that were the most useful to evaluate predictive errors (RMSEP) of quantitative phenotype characteristics or to discriminate between classes and estimate the clearly classified percentages of qualitative characters. All of the chemometrics discussed were performed using the statistical package R (R Foundation for Statistical Computing, Vienna, 2006: <u>www.R-project.org</u>).

149

### 150 **3. Results**

151 *3.1* Determination of quantitative phenotype characteristics (ISC, FW and DW).

In terms of the relationships between the quantitative phenotype characteristics themselves, measured by the standard destructive methods, it should be noted that fresh weight (FW) and dry weight (DW) were highly correlated ( $R^2$ : 0.94), demonstrating the good repeatability of the method used to measure fresh weight. Internal shell cavity (ISC) volume was moderately correlated with FW and DW ( $R^2$ : 0.56).

157 Simple univariate correlation between internal cavity volume (ISC) and the intensity of the first

echo (echo1) of the CPMG-15000 relaxation curve showed that it was possible to determine ISC

159 with a very high correlation coefficient ( $R^2$  of 0.95). In the range 4.7g to 16g, ISC was predicted

160 with a standard error of prediction of 0.62g (Table 2).

161 To eliminate the influence of the sea water protons on the NMR signal, slightly more sophisticated relationships were necessary to predict FW and DW. The results showed that the 162 163 best combination was to subtract the intensity of a spin echo strongly affected by sea water 164 protons from the first spin echo of the relaxation curve. All the possible combinations were 165 tested. After optimization, the value resulting from the subtraction of the intensity of the echo at 166 64 ms from the beginning of the relaxation curve from the first echo of the CPMG-400 data 167 appeared to be the best correlated with DW and FW, with correlation coefficients of 0.94 and 168 0.91, respectively. In the range 0.22g to 2.10g, DW was predicted with a standard error of 169 prediction of less than 0.1g (Table 2, figure 1). FW was predicted with a standard error of 170 prediction of less than 0.54g in the range 1.28g to 8.90g (Table 2).

Several combinations of latent variables resulting from the PLS procedure showed good correlations but did not provide a very significant improvement in the relationships with the different quantitative phenotype characteristics such as DW and FW despite the combinations of 5 or 6 latent variables (Table 3). However, the combination of only two latent variables resulting from the CPMG-400 curves alone provided a potentially acceptable prediction of ISC (R<sup>2</sup>: 0.93; RMSEP: 0.78g).

177 *3.2* Determination of qualitative phenotype characteristics (SEX, GD).

Stepwise linear discriminant analysis (LDA) of each CPMG curve result separately showed that SEX could be classified with a success rate of 59% and 71% with CMPG-400 and CPMG-180 15000, respectively. Based on a combination of the results from both CPMG curves, LDA showed a very significant increase in the success rate (to 93%) to predict SEX (Table 4). Discriminant function 1, explaining 78% of the variance, could be interpreted as well correlated with ploidy, and discriminant function 2 clearly separated 2N males and females (Figure 2).

184 Stepwise linear discriminant analysis based on the combination of data from both CPMG curves

185 showed that the potential of NMR relaxometry to discriminate gonad development was good,

186 with 84% of 2N oysters correctly classified (Table 5).

#### 187 **4. Discussion**

188 These preliminary results show that the low field NMR relaxometry technique is a potentially 189 non-invasive routine sensor for phenotype characterization in Crassostrea gigas. The technique 190 provides access to two important numerical representations of the quality of soft bivalve tissue: 191 the weight of the soft tissue and the meat condition index based on the percentage of the internal 192 shell volume occupied by soft body tissue. The most promising result was the estimation of the 193 fresh or dried soft tissue weight by simple bilinear regression based on the CPMG-400 curve, 194 obtained in less than a minute. Using 400 ms RD time, the weight of the very mobile hydrogen 195 atoms (protons) in the CPMG-400 relaxation signal was considerably reduced compared to less 196 mobile protons of macromolecules constituting the dry soft tissue matter, characterized by a 197 longitudinal relaxation T1 parameter that was shorter than for seawater protons. Seawater 198 protons were also characterized by a longer transverse T2 relaxation parameter: subtraction of 199 the intensity of a longer echo time, such as the 64 ms echo time, strongly weighted by the sea 200 water protons from the intensity of the first echo time, provided an indicator that was correlated 201 with the quantity of protons in the macromolecules of the dry soft tissue matter. However, Figure 202 2 shows that the dry weight of oysters with high gonad development could be slightly 203 underestimated. This could be related to the effects of differences in the biochemical 204 composition of soft tissue: gonad tissues are high in lipids (Matus de la Parra et al. 2003) which 205 have higher proton density than glycogen and proteins. Clearly this method would be less precise 206 than the gravimetric method based on lyophilization, but the new method has the advantage of 207 being fast and easy to use for routine investigations and its non-destructive nature should allow 208 precise individual follow-up studies of large oyster collections.

The NMR technique also appears to be able to provide an acceptable determination of ISC that can be used to calculate a condition index. ISC is clearly correlated with the intensity of the first echo of the non-weighted CMPG-15000 relaxation curve which indicates the quantity of all the protons from soft tissues and seawater in the NMR probe. The main difficulty is being sure that 213 the internal shell cavity volume is full of seawater and that shell valves remain closed during 214 NMR scanning. An NMR sensor with a horizontal probe would be more appropriate to reduce 215 the risk of water loss. Early methods sought to measure the internal shell cavity by volumetric 216 methods but these are slow and difficult to perform accurately. A faster and easier gravimetric 217 method was also developed: shell cavity capacity was well correlated with the difference 218 between whole oyster weight and empty shell weight after drying for 24 h (Laurence and Scott, 219 1982). However, with this method, any water contained within the shells themselves (not 220 between them) was included in the internal shell cavity weight (Abbe and Albright, 2003). The 221 same limitation exists with the NMR method which quantifies all the protons contained in the 222 NMR probe. Differences in shell morphology and fouling community structure may influence 223 shell porosity and reduce the precision of the method.

224 Exploitation of all the data originating from both CMPG relaxation curves by more sophisticated 225 chemometric methods provided encouraging results that also showed the good potential of NMR 226 to determine sex and identify gonad development. However, given the small number of 227 individuals and the difficulty in visually appreciating gonad development, further studies with 228 larger sample groups are required to validate the method. LDA performed on individuals with 229 dry tissues weighing over 0.7g provided a success rate of 100%. This clearly shows that the 230 precision of the NMR method would be lower for small individuals. The diameter of the NMR 231 probe used in this study did not allow scanning of larger oysters, particularly oysters in their 232 second or third year of maturity. Further studies are required to design an NMR probe that is 233 appropriate for bigger oysters and to improve sex discrimination and prediction of gonad 234 development with larger groups. The method to determine soft tissue weight is rapid and 235 probably sufficiently precise to investigate even small animals. The determination of internal 236 shell cavity, sex and gonad development requires the acquisition of a complementary NMR 237 signal based on a CMPG sequence with a long RD parameter. At the present time, this increases 238 the acquisition time by 7 minutes. It would probably be advisable to reduce the overall

acquisition time by half and it should be possible to replace the non-T1-weighted CPMG-15000

sequence by a slightly T1 weighted sequence with RD between 5000 and 8000ms to achieve this.

241 Another possibility would be to reduce the accumulation number (16 in the present study),

- 242 particularly for the largest oysters which deliver the strongest signal originated from soft tissues.
- 243

## 244 5. References

- Abbe, G. R., Albright, B. W., 2003. An improvement to the determination of meat condition
  index for the eastern oyster *Crassostrea virginica* (Gmelin 1791). J Shellfish Res 22:747752.
- Davenel, A., Quellec, S., Pouvreau, S. 2006. Noninvasive characterization of gonad maturation
  and determination of the sex of Pacific oysters by MRI. Magnetic Resonance Imaging 24
  (8), 1103-1110.
- Dridi, S., Salah Romdhane, M., Elcafsi, M. 2007. Seasonal variation in weight and biochemical
  composition of the Pacific oyster, *Crassostrea gigas* in relation to the gametogenic cycle
  and environmental conditions of the Bizert lagoon, Tunisia. Aquaculture 263 (1-4), 238248.
- Chavez-Villalba, J., Pommier, J., Andriamiseza, J., Pouvreau, S., Barret, J., Cochard, J.C., Le
   Pennec, M., 2000. Broodstock conditioning of the oyster *Crassostrea gigas*: origin and
   temperature effect. Aquaculture 214 (1-4), 115-130.
- Enriquez-Diaz, M., Pouvreau S., Fabioux, C., Le Coguic, Y., Cochard, J.C., Le Pennec, M.,
  2003. Reproductive strategy: Variability of reproductive pattern in two populations of
  genetically determined *Crassostrea gigas*. J Shellfish Res 22:328.
- Fabioux, C., Huvet, A., Le Souchu, P., Le Pennec, M., Pouvreau, S., 2005. Temperature and
  photoperiod drive *Crassostrea gigas* reproductive internal clock. Aquaculture 250 (1-2),
  458-470.
- Lawrence, D. R., Scott, G.I., 1982. The determination and use of condition index in oysters.
  Estuaries 5:23-27.
- Matus de la Parra, A., Garcia, O., San Juan, F., 2005. Seasonal variations on the biochemical
  composition and lipid classes of the gonad and storage tissues of *Crassostrea gigas*(Thuberg, 1794) in relation to the gametogenic cycle. J Shellfish Res 24 (2):457-467.
- 269
- 270 Namba K., Kobayashi M., Aida S., Uematsu K., Yoshida M., Kondo Y., Miyata Y., 1995.

- Persistent relaxation of the adductor muscle of oyster *Crassostrea gigas* induced by
  magnesium ion. Fish. Sci. 61, 241-244.
- Pouvreau, S., Rambeau, M., Cochard, J.C., Robert, R., 2006. Investigation of marine bivalves
  morphology by *in vivo* MR imaging: first anatomical results of a promising technique.
  Aquaculture 259 (1-4), 415-423.

276

# **Captions for figures**

- Fig.1. Prediction of dry flesh weight by subtraction of the intensity of the echo at 64 ms from the
  beginning of the CPMG-400 relaxation curve from the intensity of the first echo. Effects of
  gonad development stages (0, 1, 2, and 3). 3N individuals were classified as stage 0.
- Fig.2. Prediction of sex (3N triploid asexual oysters, 2N males and females) by discriminant
   functions originating from chemometric LDA method.

NMR	RD	TE	Accumulation	Acquisition
CPMG sequence			number	time
CPMG-400	15000 ms	2 ms	16	6 min 51 s
CPMG-15000	400 ms	1 ms	32	47 s

 Table 1. Parameters of NMR sequences

NMR data	Echo and		DW		FW		ISC
	Echo combination	R <sup>2</sup>	RMSEP	R <sup>2</sup>	RMSEP	R <sup>2</sup>	RMSEP
CPMG-400	echo1 echo1-echo64	0.78 0.94	0.100g	0.83 0.91	0.54	0.89	0.92g
CPMG-15000	echo1 echo1-echo34	0.44 0.91	0.116	0.53 0.89	0.56	0.95	0.62g

**Table 2.** Prediction of quantitative phenotype characteristics, dry flesh weight (DW), fresh flesh weight (FW) and internal shell cavity (ISC) using simple or bilinear relationship with NMR data.

RMSEP means Root Mean Square Error of Prediction

NMR data Latent		DW		FW		ISC	
	Variables	R <sup>2</sup>	RMSEP	R <sup>2</sup>	RMSEP	R <sup>2</sup>	RMSEP
CPMG-400	3 LV 2 LV	0.96	0.093g	0.94	0.52g	0.93	0.78g
CPMG-15000	6 LV	0.95	0.116g	0.92	0.58g		
GD) (G. 100.15000	5 LV	0.07	0.110	0.04	0.50	0.98	0.67g
CPMG-400-15000	5 LV 5 LV	0.96	0.110g	0.94	0.53g	0.99	0.65g

**Table 3.** Prediction of quantitative phenotype characteristics, dry flesh weight (DW), fresh flesh weight (FW) and internal shell cavity (ISC) using latent variables (LV) originating from chemometric PLS method

RMSEP means Root Mean Square Error of Prediction

"Sox " observed			« Sex » predicted	
« Sex » Observeu	11 -	3N	F	М
3N	25	<b>25</b> (100%)	0	0
F	15	0	14 (93%)	1
М	16	1	2	<b>13</b> (87%)

**Table 4.** Prediction of sex (3N, 2N males and females) using discriminant functions originating from chemometric LDA method.

GD observed	n		GD predicted	
UD Observed	11 –	1	2	3
1	2	1 (50%)	1 (50%)	0
2	10	0	7 (70%)	3 (30%)
3	19	0	4 (20%)	18 (79%)

**Table 5.** Prediction of gonad development (GD) stages (1, 2, 3) of 2N males and females using discriminant functions originating from chemometric LDA method

<u>Fig.1.</u>



<u>Fig.2.</u>



sex discriminant function 1 (78%)

Manuscript : NMR relaxometry as a potential non-invasive routine sensor for				
characterization of phenotype in	Crassostrea gigas, A. Davenel			
Reviewers' Comments	Corrections or authors' comments			
Reviewer 1				
These authors may not mentioned in their	At the present time, we have not already			
publications related to NMR or MRI	realized such comparison to evaluate the			
methods, if these non destructive techniques	impact of these non destructive methods on			
can have some impact, even very small, on	some fecundity parameters. However we			
different fecundity parameters (success of the	have realized individual tracking of group of			
spawning, quality of gametes, number of	oysters until five temporal MRI scannings			
gametes and larvae) compared to animals in	without mortality. We will take into account			
the same batches that have not been	its valuable suggestion in the future.			
investigated in vivo MR imaging.				
Reviewer 2				
Line 35. Gigas, comma is underline.	Comma have been deleted in the text			
Line 51.I will propose to add Magnetic	The proposal has been integrated in the text			
resonance imaging "Magnetic Resonance				
(NMR) and Magnetic resonance imaging				
(MRI)" to avoid the confusion between the				
two techniques. Moreover, the authors have				
published before on MRI and not on NMR.				
Line 92: Do the authors can precise where is	Location has been added in the text			
localised this NMR equipment?				
Lines 152-155. I was little confused with the	I nese relationships concern only data			
first paragraph of the results. The authors	details have been added in the text			
must precise here, that these relationships	details have been added in the text.			
standard mathada ar NMP massurament?				
Line 211 Why the authors do not insert the	In future experiments, we will take into			
animal in agar gel for ensuring that the shell	account the interesting suggestion of the			
valves remaining closed during NMR	reviewer			
scanning				
Lespecially recommend the authors to precise	We have no information concerning the			
quantitative parameters concerning the	following progenies. We will include these			
following progenies obtained with the	data in our future experiments			
animals tested by NRM techniques. I will	auta in our fatale experiments.			
appreciate that these data could be included				
either in this manuscript if the authors have				
already some informations or in their future				
studies.				
Fig. 2. I will suggest to encircle the three	We have adopted this suggestion.			
prediction of sex to be more in evidence				
Table 2 and 3. Why some data are	Bold type has been deleted.			
highlighted in bold type? RMSEP must be	RMSEP has been defined in the legend			
explain in the legend of the table.				
Reviewer 2				
	No corrections asked			