



HAL
open science

Comment on "Estimate of the vibrational frequencies of spherical virus particles"

Lucien Saviot, Daniel B. Murray, Eugène Duval, Alain Mermet

► **To cite this version:**

Lucien Saviot, Daniel B. Murray, Eugène Duval, Alain Mermet. Comment on "Estimate of the vibrational frequencies of spherical virus particles". *Physical Review E: Statistical, Nonlinear, and Soft Matter Physics*, 2004, 69, pp.023901. 10.1103/PhysRevE.69.023901 . hal-00000484v2

HAL Id: hal-00000484

<https://hal.science/hal-00000484v2>

Submitted on 2 Dec 2005

HAL is a multi-disciplinary open access archive for the deposit and dissemination of scientific research documents, whether they are published or not. The documents may come from teaching and research institutions in France or abroad, or from public or private research centers.

L'archive ouverte pluridisciplinaire **HAL**, est destinée au dépôt et à la diffusion de documents scientifiques de niveau recherche, publiés ou non, émanant des établissements d'enseignement et de recherche français ou étrangers, des laboratoires publics ou privés.

Comment on "Estimate of the vibrational frequencies of spherical virus particles"

Lucien Saviot

Laboratoire de Recherche sur la Réactivité des Solides, UMR 5613 CNRS - Université de Bourgogne
9 avenue A. Savary, BP 47870 - 21078 Dijon - France*

Daniel B. Murray

Department of Physics, Okanagan University College, Kelowna, British Columbia, Canada V1V 1V7†

Alain Mermet‡ and Eugène Duval§

Laboratoire de Physico-Chimie des Matériaux Luminescents, UMR 5620 CNRS - Université Lyon I
43, boulevard du 11 Novembre 69622 Villeurbanne Cedex - France

(Dated: December 2, 2005)

This comment corrects some errors which appeared in the calculation of an elastic sphere eigenenergies. As a result, the symmetry of the mode having the lowest frequency is changed. Also a direction for calculating the damping of these modes for embedded elastic spheres is given.

PACS numbers: 87.50.Kk, 43.64.+r, 87.15.La

In a recent article¹, L. H. Ford discusses the normal modes of vibration of spherical virus particles using a liquid drop model and an elastic sphere model.

However the analysis errs in calculating the energy of the $n = 0$ spheroidal mode with the elastic sphere model. This same error is recurrent in the literature^{2,3,4,5}. Some authors have since corrected them⁶. The original Lamb paper⁷ was correct and an explanation is available elsewhere⁸. This error results in additional energies which do not correspond to any vibration eigenmode. It gives a wrong energy for the lowest $n = 0$ spheroidal mode comparable to the one of the lowest $n = 2$ spheroidal mode. For materials with positive Poisson ratio, it is impossible to have the energy for the fundamental $n = 0$ mode smaller than the energy for the fundamental $n = 2$ one.

Equation 3 in the paper is valid for n different from zero. For n equal to zero, $S_{rp}(0, x, y) = 0$ should be used

instead (see equation 4). Moreover, expressions given in equations 4 and 7 are invalid: there is no square dependence and the sign of S_{ts} is wrong. With correct calculations, the lowest frequencies for the elastic sphere model are reached with $n = 2$ modes and frequencies are a bit lower (9.2, 9.4 and 4.6 GHz for Nylon, Polystyrene and Polyethylene respectively).

We also would like to point out that these normal modes are damped when the virus particle is embedded inside a liquid. Estimations of damping can be made using the "complex frequency" approach described elsewhere^{9,10}. When the virus is inside water for example, there is not much acoustic impedance mismatch at the surface. For this reason the normal modes will be broad and have short lifetimes. Therefore, the objective of killing viruses by sending out sound waves that resonate and destroy them is probably unworkable in such a configuration.

* Electronic address: lucien.saviot@u-bourgogne.fr

† Electronic address: dmurray@ouc.bc.ca

‡ Electronic address: mermet@pcml.univ-lyon1.fr

§ Electronic address: duval@pcml.univ-lyon1.fr

¹ L. H. Ford, Phys. Rev. E **67**, 051924 (2003).

² A. C. Eringen and E. S. Suhubi (Academic, New York, 1975), vol. II, pp. 804-833.

³ M. Fujii, T. Nagareda, S. Hayashi, and K. Yamamoto, Phys. Rev. B **44**, 6243 (1991).

⁴ A. Tanaka, S. Onari, and T. Arai, Phys. Rev. B **47**, 1237 (1993).

⁵ M. H. Kuok, H. S. Lim, S. C. Ng, N. N. Liu, and Z. K. Wang, Phys. Rev. Lett. **90**, 255502 (2003), erratum

to be published.

⁶ M. Fujii, T. Nagareda, S. Hayashi, and K. Yamamoto, Phys. Rev. B **52**, 14273 (1995).

⁷ H. Lamb, Proc. London Math. Soc. **13**, 187 (1882).

⁸ L. Saviot, B. Champagnon, E. Duval, I. A. Kudriavtsev, and A. I. Ekimov, Journal of Non-Crystalline Solids **197**, 238 (1996).

⁹ V. A. Dubrovskiy and V. Morozhnik, Earth Physics **17**, 494 (1981).

¹⁰ L. Saviot, D. B. Murray, and M. d. C. Marco de Lucas (2003), cond-mat/0307634.